



NJ Election Law Enforcement Commission

March 2023



ERIC H. JASO Chairman

STEPHEN M. HOLDEN Commissioner

MARGUERITE T. SIMON

### **ELECTION LAW ENFORCEMENT COMMISSION**

Respond to: P.O. Box 185 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0185 (609) 292-8700

Website: http://www.elec.nj.gov

JEFFREY M. BRINDLE Executive Director

JOSEPH W. DONOHUE Deputy Director

STEPHANIE A. OLIVO Compliance Director

EDWIN R. MATTHEWS Legal Counsel

### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

"Recall Elections in New Jersey- Citizen Safety Valve or Empty Threat?" is the 30<sup>th</sup> white paper released by the New Jersey Election Law Enforcement Commission (ELEC) since 1988.

This series has been cited in media reports, the political science literatures, and in studies prepared by sister agencies and advocacy groups.

The documents serve as reference works and provide valuable background and guidance for the Governor's Office, legislators and other policy makers. Some recommendations have helped spur legislative proposals and even new laws.

Deputy Director Joseph W. Donohue is the author of White Paper 30: "Recall Elections in New Jersey-Citizen Safety Valve or Empty Threat?"

General editors and proofreaders included Executive Director Jeffrey M. Brindle, Deputy Legal Director Amanda Haines, and Administrative Analyst Chris Vigale. Research Associate Steven Kimmelman did substantial research and proofing. Intern Kelsey Snipes helped with an early draft of the report.

Administrative Assistant Elbia L. Zeppetelli helped with proofreading and creatively assembled the final document.

Special thanks Rita M. Rothberg, Cape May County Clerk, Adjuster and County Historian, for helping to verify the state's first successful recall election. Additional thanks to Union County Clerk Joanne Rajoppi for assisting with research on a recall drive in her county. ELEC Report Examiner Milene Matos helped arrange contacts with these and other local officials.

Additional appreciation goes to Professor Henry A. Coleman, former director of the Center for Government Services at Rutgers University, for taking a break from his well-deserved retirement to arrange for the center to provide a copy of a 1994 report on recalls.

All 30 white papers are available on ELEC's website at www.elec.nj.gov.

# TABLE ON CONTENTS

RECALL ELECTIONS IN NJ	1
Recall Elections in NJ – Introduction and Summary	3
Early Recalls in NJ	7
Recall History Enlivened by Colorful Characters and Wild Twists	8
1993 Constitutional Amendment and 1995 Recall Law	11
Most Notable Recall in NJ	12
Multi-Candidate Slates that were Recall Casualties	13
Mayors Frequent Targets	14
Several Officials Mostly Mayors, Charged with Crimes	14
Recalls by Municipality	17
Recalls by County	19
School Board Recalls Remain Rare	20
No NJ Gubernatorial Recalls	21
Few Legislators Targeted for Recalls	22
County Officials Largely Spared Recall Headaches	23
Recent Recall Activity	24
Effort to Recall U.S. Senator Invalidates Part of Law	26
RECALL ELECTIONS NATIONALLY	29
Historical Roots of Right to Recall	30
Current National Perspective	31
Few Governors or State Legislators Recalled Nationally	31
California- Epicenter for Political Earthquakes	32
Other States with Notable Recalls	33
CONCLUSION	35
HOW INFORMATION WAS COMPILED FOR THIS REPORT	40
RECALL ELECTIONS BY YEAR	41
APPENDIX – RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY	48
DDEVIOUS WHITE DADEDS	92

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	Recall Elections in New Jersey, Key Events	1
2.	NJ Recall Drives by the Numbers	2
3.	Summary of Recall Election Activity in New Jersey Since 1911	5
4.	Officials Charged with Crimes Who Also Were Facing Recall Drives.	
	All are Mayors, Except Where Noted	15
5.	Municipalities that have Recalled More than One Official	17
6.	Municipalities Where Ten or More Officials Were Recall Targets	18
7.	Recall Statistics by County/Statewide	19
8.	National Recall Election Chronology	29
9.	Number of Recall Attempts and Recalls by Decade	36
10.	Signature Threshold Requirements for Recall Petitions	38

	Table 1					
	Recall Elections in New Jersey-					
	Key Events					
1911	First recall law enacted by Governor Woodrow Wilson. It applies to only local officials.					
1914	First recall election- Deal Mayor William Levy wins reelection while one targeted commissioner resigns before election.					
1921	First recall election that directly removes officials- Wildwood voters oust Mayor W. C. Hendee and Commissioners Frank E. Smith and Oliver Bright.					
1959	Most officials recalled in a single election – 5 municipal officials in Hackensack. <sup>1</sup>					
1978	Largest number of recalled officials in one year- six.					
1984	Atlantic City Mayor Michael Matthews, arguably the best known victim of a New Jersey recall because his scandal is national news, is removed by local voters.					
1993	NJ voters by 1,326,657 to 414,925 margin approve amendment to state Constitution expanding recalls to federal and state officials as well as school board members.					
1995	Legislation overwhelmingly approved and signed by Governor Christine Todd Whitman implements the Constitutional amendment.					
2006	Year with most targeted officials- 22.					
2010	NJ Supreme Court rules 4-2 that 1995 law cannot apply to federal officials.					
2018	Most recent recall victim- Mahwah Mayor William LaForet.					

#### **Recall Election Basics**

- An elected official cannot face recall until after they have served at least a year of their term. An official also cannot be recalled if they are within six months of a general election.
- For a recall election to be held, organizers must collect signatures from 25 percent of the registered voters within the jurisdiction represented by the targeted official. Those signatures must be validated by appropriate election officials.
- Organizers have about 11 months to collect the signatures if the recall drive relates to a statewide office, or about five-and-a-half months if it targets other officials.
- Targets of recalls as well as recall organizers can set up committees to raise and spend funds. Contribution limits that apply to candidates also apply to recall committees, and organizers must file disclosure reports with ELEC.- Added 4/3/23

NJ Election Law Enforcement Commission White Paper No. 30

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> North Bergen in 1978 and West New York in 1993 also ousted five local officials in single elections but reelected them in the same elections.

Table 2 NJ Recall Drives by the Number	S
Key Recall Election Facts	Number
Number of Targeted Officials Since 1911	649
Number of Recall Elections	80
Recall Election Losers	96
Recall Election Winners	60
Recalled Officials Reelected in Same Election	14
Possible Seats Lost Despite Failure of Recall Drive <sup>2</sup>	87
Most Spending on a Recall -West New York 2009	\$120,765
Recalls by Office Type	
Municipal Lawmakers <sup>3</sup>	61
Mayors	33
School Board Members	2
Governors	0
Legislators	0
County Officials	0
<b>Locations with Most Officials Targeted by Recalls</b>	
Hackensack	30
Bergen County	105
<b>Locations with Most Recalled Officials</b>	
North Bergen <sup>4</sup>	14
Hudson County <sup>5</sup>	19

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Resigned, opted not to run for reelection, removed from office or lost reelection after an unsuccessful recall drive. Does not include recalled officials.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Council, commission, or township committee members.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In 1978, local voters recalled five officials but reelected them in same election.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Ibid.

### **INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY**

A recall election allows for the removal of public officials by popular vote before their term is completed if certain requirements are met.<sup>6</sup>

Researchers at the National Conference of State Legislatures have summarized the pros and cons:

Supporters of the recall process believe it provides a way for citizens to exercise control over elected officials who fail to represent their constituents' best interests, or who are unresponsive or incompetent. This view maintains that an elected representative is an agent or a servant of their constituents, not their master.

Opponents argue that recalls can lead to an excess of democracy: That the threat of a recall election lessens the independence of elected officials; undermines the principle of electing good officials and giving them a chance to govern; and can be abused by well-financed special interest groups and give them undue influence over the political process.<sup>7</sup>

In New Jersey, where the first state law allowing recall elections was enacted in 1911, recall elections are as rare as Jersey Devil sightings.

Few voters have ever taken part in one.

Just 80 have occurred in 112 years. In those elections, 96 officials- all municipal elected officials-were sent packing while 60 other local officials held onto their seats.

Recall elections have occurred in 56 municipalities- just 10 percent of the 564 New Jersey municipalities. They have been attempted in just a third of the state's municipalities (184).

In the 28 years since state officials became fair game for recall elections, not one has been forced out of office.

Recall attempts have been launched against four New Jersey governors. None have come close to triggering a special election.

Nor has a single state legislator been removed from office or even faced a recall election based on their state position.<sup>8</sup>

One county freeholder (now called commissioner) and one county sheriff opted not to run for reelection following recall threats. Despite a handful of attempts, no recall election has been held involving county executives, county freeholders or commissioners, clerks, surrogates, or sheriffs.

Municipal officials have been the main target of New Jersey recall laws. ELEC research indicates that 642 of the 649 elected officials- 99 percent- targeted by recall drives were local.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Foner, Eric, "Give Me Liberty! An American History." Sixth Edition. New York. W.W. Norton & Co. 2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> https://www.ncsl.org/research/elections-and-campaigns/recall-of-state-officials.aspx downloaded 7/8/22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Some mayors who also were state legislators faced recall attempts targeting their local offices.

Even their political body count is miniscule.

Only one local official has been recalled in the last 13 years, a period when more than 50,000 local officials were elected to office. One in six targeted officials have been recalled.

A reason most recall drives fail may be because they attract little funding.

While recall drives can be intense, New Jersey recall campaigns typically have run on a shoestring. Single recall elections in states like California have drawn millions of dollars in spending.

While campaign finance information is unavailable for recall elections that took place before the 1995 law, reports filed with ELEC since that year show less than \$500,000 COMBINED has been spent on New Jersey recall elections.

The most spending in a single campaign occurred in West New York in 2009, when a committee spent \$120,765 on an ultimately unsuccessful attempt.

Given these statistics, some might view recalls as ineffective. But when they do happen, they can inflict serious political damage to individuals and dissension within communities.

Shark attacks are rare. That doesn't mean you want to be a victim. A candidate facing a recall election has a nearly a 60 percent chance they will be shown the exit by voters.

In addition to 96 officials directly ousted through recall elections, another 51 officials targeted by recall movements either resigned or were removed, 29 opted not to run again and seven lost in regular elections after being targeted for recall.

The late Rider University professor David Rebovich once described recalls as "the political equivalent of the nuisance lawsuit. There's usually not a lot to them. But you do have to take them seriously or else they can really bite you."

Robert Ellenport, who served as mayor of Clark in the 1990s, said even when a recall movement falls short, it can cause havoc not just for the targeted official but the whole community.

"It was very frustrating. It really started to divide the town," he said. In his case, Ellenport said he fought back and rebuffed the recall drive because he felt he "did nothing wrong." He was reelected for a second term in the next regular election.

If recalls of elected officials are uncommon in New Jersey, it is largely due to the design of the original sponsors. Recalls were not supposed to be easy.

"They wanted it to be difficult. They didn't want it to be based on a whim," said veteran Cranford attorney and political observer Frank Capece.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Brad Parks, "Voters Showing Signs of a Recall Fever," The Star-Ledger, February 4, 2007.

	Table 3 Summary of Recall Election Activity in New Jersey Since 1911							
Position	Targeted	No Recall Election	Recalled	Not Recalled	Opted Not to Run Again	Reelected **	Resigned/ Removed	
Mayor	216	159	33	23	10	7	22	
Municipal Council Member	216	166	32	17	8	2	11	
Municipal Commissioner	109	61	29	19		11	11	
Board of Education	81	78	2	1	6	2	7	
Township Committee member	13				2			
Governor	4	4						
<b>County Sheriff</b>	1	1			1			
County Freeholder*	3	3			2			
State Senator	1	1						
State Senate President	1	1						
US Senator	1	1						
Fire Commissioner	1	1						
County Executive	1	1						
Village President (Mayor)	1	1						
<b>Grand Total</b>	649	489	96	60	29	22	51	

<sup>\*</sup>Now called county commissioner. \*\*Includes 14 same election

State Senator William Schluter (R-Hunterdon) co-sponsored the 1995 law that expanded recalls to state and federal officials. He said the sponsors intentionally set a high bar so recalls essentially would be a last resort.

"We didn't want this to be a frivolous thing like they have in California. You don't want this to be just political reprisal and political tools." <sup>10</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Robert Schwaneberg, "Gray Davis' big mistake: He didn't hold office in Trenton," The Star-Ledger, October 9, 2003.

The result is that the right to recall in New Jersey "has turned out to be a minor footnote in New Jersey politics." <sup>11</sup>

Regardless of its overall impact, the right to recall is now a constitutional right in New Jersey. Moreover, the single state law that took effect in 1995 replaced a patchwork of laws that existed earlier.

Though recalls are hard to achieve in New Jersey, former Governor Christine Todd Whitman, who signed the statute, still believes the law has a deterrent effect. "The fact that it is there it is somewhat of a warning and a little bit of a guardrail against some behavior," she said.<sup>12</sup>

One other note. Due to time constraints and incomplete data, no serious effort was made to analyze the reasons behind recall drives. Looking at the limited information that is available, higher taxes often have been a trigger for recall movements along with hiring and final decisions (especially with school boards), various budget issues, and alleged corruption or malfeasance.

Perhaps because of their rarity, most recall elections in New Jersey have drawn little examination.

This white paper seeks to fill this void by compiling and analyzing what is believed to be the most comprehensive list of New Jersey recalls ever. It provides a historic record where none currently exists.

This information hopefully will offer a useful guide to lawmakers, policy analysts, citizens groups, interested individuals and the media. The report also may serve as a reminder of a right many voters may not even know exists.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> George Amick, "Recalls a Minor Footnote in NJ Politics," The Times (Trenton), June 13, 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Interview with ELEC Executive Director Jeff Brindle on June 3, 2022.

### **EARLY RECALLS IN NEW JERSEY**

The right to a recall election was first incorporated into New Jersey statutes during the term of then-Governor and future President Woodrow Wilson, who held the office of Governor from 1911 to 1913.

Wilson signed Chapter Law 221, sponsored by Assemblyman Allan Walsh of Trenton, on April 25, 1911. It included a provision for the recall of local officials though it excluded members of boards of education and civil servants. It applied to 32 municipalities at the time that adopted a commission form of government.

To hold a recall election, 25 percent of voters in the preceding general election were required to sign a recall petition. It could be held only after an incumbent served at least one year of his or her term. The provision also stressed that a recall attempt could be made against an official only once during their term in office. <sup>13</sup>

Recall movements quickly erupted in Atlantic City, Long Branch, Trenton, Wildwood and other cities. A petition filed with Long Branch officials even demanded the recall of a school janitor, which wasn't permitted under the law.<sup>14</sup>

The first New Jersey recall election took place June 27, 1914.

In that contest, Deal Mayor and recall target William Levy retained his office in a vote of 84-46 against opponent, Charles Fritz. The challenger, a Progressive whose party had pushed to create the right to recall, wanted to reduce the number of commissioners from five to three. That proposal also failed.<sup>15</sup>

"The election was hotly contested, both factions making a strong effort to get the vote out, the poll showing that about four-fifths of the voters of the little borough participated." <sup>16</sup>

The recall drive wasn't a total flop. Two commissioners originally named in recall petitions resigned before they could face the special election. There was one more recall push in Deal in 1946 but it didn't trigger an election.

A Rahway mayor who prompted a 1919 recall election refused to take part and was required by law to give up his seat.

The first known recall election where voters directly removed officials occurred in Wildwood in 1921. Mayor William Hendee and Commissioners Oliver Bright and Frank Smith were fired by a majority of voters.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> "Rule by Commission Measure Is Now Law" Trenton Evening Times. April 26, 1911.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> "Would Recall Long Branch Janitor," Asbury Park Evening Press, January 2, 1914.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> "Deal Beach Recall Fails," The New York Times, June 28, 1914.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> "Attempt to Recall Deal's Mayor Fails," Trenton Evening Times (published as Sunday Times Advertiser), June 28, 1914.

The deposed officials were accused of creating an atmosphere of dissension and mismanaging local finances, making Wildwood "the laughingstock of the public at large." It is notable that women, who won the right to vote just one year earlier, were a "big factor in turning tables on the old guard." <sup>18</sup>

### RECALL HISTORY ENLIVENED BY COLORFUL CHARACTERS AND WILD TWISTS

During a history that spans more than a century, recall campaigns nationally and in New Jersey have offered a kaleidoscope of characters and drama.

Take the 1934 recall in Issaquah, Washington, when voters in the tiny Pacific northwest coal mining town jettisoned Mayor Stella Alexander by a vote of 206 to 85.

"Madame Mussolini,' as her political enemies referred to her, had caused more commotion in Issaquah than a bucking bronco by taking issues with the council and firing the town marshal, slashing budgets and blocking inauguration of a couple of elected officials." <sup>19</sup>

"But she's not downcast. As she put it: 'Next time I'll go out for a big job. One that pays some money- sheriff or something."<sup>20</sup>

New Jersey has its own examples that were entertaining, tragic, or sometimes both.

- Before Bradley Beach Mayor William E. Macdonald survived a May 9, 1916 recall election by a 271-165 margin, the Asbury Park Evening Press published the full list of 165 citizens who sought the recall.<sup>21</sup> On the day of the recall, "The social committee of the Ladies' Aid society of the Bradley Beach M.E. Church conducted a very successful luncheon at the boro hall during the recall election."<sup>22</sup>
- In 1919, James B. Furber declined to run in a recall election and was forced to give up his seat as a municipal commissioner in Rahway. He had served three terms as a mayor, running separately as a Republican, an independent and as a socialist.<sup>23</sup> He made a comeback and was reelected in 1922 only to again resign his seat two years later facing the threat of a second recall election.<sup>24</sup> He later moved to Linden and in 1930 won an "amazing" upset over the incumbent mayor. Tragically, before he could take office, he suffered a stroke and died while speaking to the local Democratic club.<sup>25</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> "Wildwood has Three New Commissioners Now for Business, Not Politics," Five Mile Beach Weekly Journal, June 15, 1921.

<sup>18</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> "Petticoat Politicians' Outlawed in Mining Town of the Northwest," Associated Press, January 8, 1934.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> "Macdonald Recall Approved; May 9 Set for Election," Asbury Park Evening Press, April 10, 1916.

<sup>22</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> "Linden Mayor-Elect Dies After Stroke," Plainfield Courier-News, November 12, 1930.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> "Rahway's Mayor Quits to Forestall Recall," Associated Press, March 29, 1924.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> "Linden Mayor-Elect Dies After Stroke," Plainfield Courier-News, November 12, 1930.

- In what was described as "the most exciting, bitterest and hardest fought in local history," Ocean City voters in 1929 turned out in droves to re-elect long-time Mayor Joseph Champion despite charges that he encouraged bootlegging and gambling in the resort. Indictments containing the allegations against the mayor and 20 members of the police department were dismissed before the recall election "as lacking foundation."
- During the Keansburg recall election in 1934 in which the mayor and two council members survived, a drunken voter walked into one polling place and fell several times. After he was asked to leave, he started driving away and police arrested him for drunk driving.<sup>27</sup>
- Doris Bradway, mayor of Wildwood, New Jersey's only woman mayor at the time, in 1938 also became the first woman official to suffer defeat in a recall election. She blamed her loss on Jersey City Mayor Frank Hague, at the time the Democratic boss of the New Jersey.
- Ironically, recall elections originally were touted by Progressive era advocates as a tool to reduce the power of machine politics. Boss Hague also used a recall threat to force Jersey City Municipal Commissioner John Saul to resign in 1927. Hague also was the main issue in the 1949 recall election, during which Mayor Paul F. Cullum and Municipal Commissioner John J. Roe accused each other of being Hague henchmen. Voters tossed both out of office.<sup>28</sup>
- After his election as Atlantic City Mayor in May 1940, Tommy "Two Gun" Taggert, who wore pearl-adorned revolvers on his belt and often led raids of gambling joints, fell out of favor with political bosses in Atlantic County who then began a recall drive. The recall option was abandoned after they found a better one- ordering city commission members to drastically curtail Taggert's mayoral powers. He lost reelection in 1944.<sup>29</sup>
- Lodi Mayor Christopher Paci, who defeated incumbent John Bombace in a 1975 recall contest, was "under 24-hour police guard because of a reported underworld contract on his life." He not only stayed alive and served as mayor many years but later fended off a recall effort against him in 1983.
- The home of a leader of an ultimately unsuccessful recall drive against the mayor in East Orange in 1976 was firebombed. The fire was put out before there was serious damage.<sup>31</sup>
- In 1981, Joseph J. Bloom Jr. defeated Mayor Howard Kushner in an Island Heights recall election. Four years later, Mayor Bloom was tossed out via recall.<sup>32</sup>

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> "Champion Vindicated by Confidence Vote at Shore," Millville Daily Republican, July 31, 1929.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> "Keansburg Votes Against Recall; Six Are Arrested," Asbury Park Evening Press, November 10, 1934.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> "North Bergen Ousters Mayor," Plainfield Courier-News, May 18, 1949.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Nelson Johnson, "Boardwalk Empire," Pages 139-140, 2002.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> "Under Guard," Camden-Courier Post, November 4, 1975.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> "Home of Recall Drive Chief Fire Bombed in East Orange," Associated Press, August 9, 1976.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> "Island Heights Mayor Ouster," Newark Star-Ledger, August 15, 1985.

- Joseph Lipari had a good run after defeating Passaic Mayor Robert Hare in a 1983 recall race. His luck ran out in 1992, when he resigned under threat of another recall and after Passaic council voted to remove him from office. He stepped down in the wake of a federal conviction on conspiracy and tax evasion charges.<sup>33</sup>
- After long-time Stafford Township Mayor Wesley K. Bell was recalled in December 1983 by a group called GROW (Get Rid of Wes), he convinced the state appellate court that he deserved reinstatement. The state Supreme Court overturned that ruling before he could take back his post.<sup>34</sup>
- A federal grand jury charged West New York Mayor Felix Roque and his 22-year-old son with three counts related to shutting down a website seeking the mayor's recall.<sup>35</sup> The recall never happened and in 2013, Roque was acquitted though his son was convicted of the misdemeanor offense of computer hacking.<sup>36</sup> Roque Sr. was reelected in 2015.

\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Corky Siemaszko, "Lipari Quits Bids Tearful Farewell to Allies," The Record, December 2, 1992.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> "High Court in New Jersey Rules in Stafford Case," New York Times, February 14, 1984.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Matt McNab, "Roque and Son Indicted in Hacking to Silence Critics: Recall Website Taken Down Through Ruse, Feds Allege," Jersey Journal, August 19, 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Michaelangelo Conte, "Roque is Back to Being Doc," Jersey Journal, October 3, 2013.

### 1993 CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT AND 1995 RECALL LAW

Prior to 1995, only six counties held the right to recall under the Optional County Charter Law: Atlantic, Bergen, Essex, Hudson, Mercer, and Union counties. The Walsh Act and two other laws- the 1923 Manager Act and the 125 Optional Municipal Charter Law of 1950- enabled recall elections in 164 municipalities.<sup>37</sup>

The 1911 law had big loopholes. It didn't apply to state or federal officials, or school board members. That changed in the 1990s, when recall reform sprung from voter outrage over tax hikes approved by Governor Jim Florio and the Democratic Legislative majority.

As part of the Republican response, Assembly Minority Leader Garabed (Chuck) Haytaian (R- Warren)<sup>38</sup> proposed a constitutional amendment that permitted the recall of elected state officials, including the Governor, members of Congress and board of education members, which were excluded under the 1911 law.

"I understand that I could very well be the target of such a recall movement at some point in the future. But I strongly believe the voters should have the constitutional right to remove those elected representatives they feel no longer represent their best interests." <sup>39</sup>

At the same time, Haytaian said he didn't want to make recall a vehicle for gratuitous pot-shots and chose a threshold of 25 percent of registered voters- a much higher hurdle for organizers.

He had also sponsored an alternate bill that would have set the signature requirement at 25 percent of votes cast in the previous election. It would have made recalls easier to attain and more like the threshold used in other states. <sup>40</sup> He chose not to pursue that option.

"Meeting the (signature) threshold may not be easy, but recall was never intended to be a vehicle to harass incumbents for the sake of harassment," Haytaian said. "It is supposed to be a means to remove officials for good cause."

Another provision to discourage petty recalls prevents recalls during the first year of a term of office. This was intended to avoid "a potential do-over" after close elections. 42

<sup>40</sup> Kelly Richmond, "Whitman Acts to Put Recall in Closer Reach of Voters," The Record, May 2, 1995.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Michael A. Pane, "The New Recall Law: Will All Petitions End in Litigation?," New Jersey Municipalities magazine, October 1995

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Vincent R. Zarate, "Assembly Republicans Act for Recall Legislation," The Star-Ledger, June 29, 1990.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Matthew Reilly, "Governor Enacts Guidelines for Recall Elections," The Star-Ledger, May 19, 1995.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Robert Schwaneberg, "Gray Davis's big mistake: He didn't hold office in Trenton," The Star-Ledger, October 9, 2003.

Even with these strict provisions, Florio opposed the idea of allowing recall as well as initiative and referendum, which gives voters the right to put their concerns on the ballot. "We are elected to lead and that's what I'm doing," said Florio.<sup>43</sup>

Florio wasn't alone in resisting the proposal.

Lucy Heller, governmental director of the League of Women Voters said, "I can't see that it brings anything positive to the process ... Clearly, it would make the idea of running for any public office less attractive to the kind, intelligent, fair-minded people we need to be making public policy decisions."

Despite such concerns, voters by a 76 percent to 24 percent margin approved the constitutional amendment in a November 1993 referendum.

In March of 1995, both legislative houses voted overwhelmingly to approve the bill granting the right to recall state and federal officials. Governor Christine Todd Whitman supported the right to recall but vetoed the initial bill. She requested more time be allotted to collect petition signatures as well as to provide that no recall committee or individual may sponsor a recall against the same official more than once in any single term.

The revision meant that the time to collect signatures for Governor and U.S. Senators would be raised to 320 days instead of 180 days, and to 160 days instead of 90 days for all other officeholders. Whitman's change was quickly accepted by both houses of the Legislature<sup>45</sup> with just two no votes in the lower house. The governor signed the bill on May 17, 1995.<sup>46</sup>

New Jersey's threshold is considerably higher than in California, where recalls occur regularly. In California, a governor can be recalled if opponents collect signatures from 12 percent of votes cast in the last election for that office.

#### MOST NOTABLE RECALL IN NJ

Michael Matthews was arguably the best-known casualty of a New Jersey recall election. His recall received statewide and even national news coverage.

Just as the casino industry was beginning to flourish in Atlantic City, Matthews held the office of mayor for 20 months of his four-year term (1982-1984). He was recalled by voters on March 13, 1984

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Tom Johnson, "Women Voters, Common Cause Urge Defeat of Recall Amendment," The Star-Ledger, October 27, 1993.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Matthew Reilly, "More Time Clears for Recall Action." The Star-Ledger, May 12, 1995.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Bill No. A25. Bill Information 1994-1995 Session. Govnetnj.com.

with a 3-2 margin. <sup>47</sup> The recall campaign was instigated by James Usry, who earned the position of mayor after Matthews.

Usry's supporters claimed, "Mr. Matthews was not communicating with black neighborhoods and was doing little to solve casino-related housing and crime problems or to bring casino-related prosperity to struggling business and residential sections of the city." 48

Not helping his case was the fact that in December 1983, Matthews was indicted on charges of accepting \$200,000 from members of the crime family of Nicodemo "Little Nicky" Scarfo in exchange for helping to secure an Atlantic City parcel zoned for casinos.<sup>49</sup>

Following his recall, he pleaded guilty on November 27, 1984 to one count of extortion for accepting a \$10,000 bribe from an undercover FBI agent posing as a developer with ties to Scarfo. <sup>50</sup>

Matthews also served as a state Assembly member from 1978 through 1984. His legislative term ended a few months before his recall and indictment.

Though facing a maximum of 15 years in prison, Matthews was released from Allenwood PA, Federal Prison in March of 1990 after serving 5 ½ years. He died in 2014 at the age of 79.

### MULTI-CANDIDATE SLATES THAT WERE RECALL CASUALTIES

The most officials ever ejected in a single New Jersey election occurred in 1959, when Mayor Edgar Duell and all four members of the Hackensack council were ousted due to voter outrage over revised tax assessments.<sup>51</sup> Two council members were later reelected, one as mayor.<sup>52</sup> <sup>53</sup>

During a Depression-era period when Asbury Park was bankrupt, four council members were swept out of office in 1935.<sup>54</sup> Mayor Sherman O. Dennis, who was supposed to be on the recall ballot, had a worse fate. He died three weeks earlier.<sup>55</sup>

In 1978, North Bergen voters recalled Mayor Peter Mocco and four township commissioners. They were simultaneously reelected when the opposing slate failed to gain enough votes.<sup>56</sup> The defeated

<sup>49</sup> "Matthews Requests New Trial," Associated Press, October 5, 1988.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Donald Janson, "Mayor Recalled in Atlantic City by a 3-2 Margin." New York Times, March 14, 1984.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Donald Janson, "Ex-Mayor, At Trial, Enters a Guilty Plea in Atlantic City Case," New York Times, November 28, 1984.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> "Hackensack Rule Halted by Recall," Associated Press, October 7, 1959.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> "Peter A. Frapaul, Hackensack Mayor," Asbury Park Evening Press, October 17, 1962.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> "Harry Bosshard, 71, Longtime Civic Leader," The Record, March 1, 1985.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> "Job Shake-Up Looms as Hetrick Wins," Asbury Park Evening Press, April 10, 1935.

<sup>55 &</sup>quot;Final Rites Held for Mayor Dennis at His Home Here," Asbury Park Evening Press, March 22, 1935.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> "Mocco Team Loses Recall Wins Election," Newark Star-Ledger, April 6, 1978.

opponents accused the incumbents of corruption, charges the winners denied while accusing former leaders of trying to get back into power.

In North Bergen's first recall election in 1949, Mayor Paul Cullum and two commissioners were given the voter heave-ho after seeking the recall as a vote of confidence.<sup>57</sup>

West New York Mayor Anthony DeFino and four council members, facing allegations that taxes and crime were up, were recalled in a 1993 election. But voters in the same election decided to re-elect them over the slate of candidates making the accusations.<sup>58</sup>

In Lodi in 1960, citizens gave the boot to Mayor John Scibetta and three council members in the wake of a grand jury probe involving the regional sewer system.<sup>59</sup> The Lodi officials were not charged.

Citizens in Brick Township in 1954 tried to recall the entire school board to no avail since the law at the time didn't permit it.<sup>60</sup>

### **MAYORS FREQUENT TARGETS**

Since mayors often are the most high-profile local officials and make tough decisions, they have tended to draw recall attempts. Being targeted for recall is almost a rite of passage in some cities.

Former Newark Mayor Kenneth Gibson faced three separate- and unsuccessful- recall drives.

Ten Atlantic City mayors had to deal with recall movements while eight Lodi mayors and seven each in Newark, Keansburg, Hackensack and Wildwood felt recall heat. Six mayors were targets in Asbury Park. Five mayors each were caught in voter cross-hairs in Camden and North Bergen.

Interestingly, Wildwood, with a permanent population of only about 5,100, has recalled the most mayors- four- though one was later reelected.

#### SEVERAL OFFICIALS, MOSTLY MAYORS, CHARGED WITH CRIMES

Perhaps the most valid reason for seeking to remove an official from office is because the officeholder committed a crime.

Along with Atlantic City Mayor Matthews, nine other mayors and four council members faced recall attempts around the same time they were charged with crimes.

Twelve did prison time, with one dying while in custody.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> "North Bergen Ousts Mayor," Associated Press, May 18, 1949.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Miri Ascarelli, "Defino Triumphs- WNY Nods to Recall But Votes for Incumbents," Jersey Journal, February 3, 1993.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> "Lodi Officials Are Ousted," Associated Press, December 28, 1960.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> "Brick Organization Halts Try to Recall Local School Board," Asbury Park Evening Press, October 3, 1954.

	Table 4 Officials Charged With Crimes Who Also Were Facing Recall Drives.						
City	All Are Mayors Except Where Noted  City Year Official Recalled? Charges Outcome						
Atlantic City	1984	Matthews, Michael	Recalled	Extortion	Prison		
Bloomfield	2016	Chalet, Elias*	No Recall Election	Bribery	Resigned; died in prison from COVID-19		
Camden City	2000	Milan, Milton	No Recall Election	Multiple corruption charges	Removed; Prison		
Fair Lawn	1958	Matule, Joseph*	No Recall Election	Extortion conspiracy	Prison		
Hazlet	2006	Coughlin, Paul A.	No Recall Election	Bribery	Resigned; prison		
Jefferson	1974 Atkinson, Ralph M. Recall resident with road		Resigned; \$1,000 fine; Conviction overturned; Acquitted				
Jersey City	1971	Whelan, Thomas J.	No Recall Election	Extortion conspiracy	Resigned; prison		
Jersey City	1971	Flaherty, Thomas J.*	No Recall Election	Extortion conspiracy	Resigned; prison		
Jersey City	2010	Vega, Mariano*	No Recall Election	Conspiracy, bribery	Resigned; prison		
Millville	1950	Cherivtch, Simon	NO Recall		Prison; Served time and finished mayoral term		
Oradell	2000	Snedeker, James	No Recall Election	Pled guilty to stealing from client trust funds;	Resigned; Disbarred as attorney; Required to repay \$48,000		
Orange	2007	Hackett, Mims	No Recall Election	Bribery	Resigned; prison		
Passaic City	1992	Lipari, Joseph	No Recall Election	Conspiracy, tax evasion	Resigned; prison; fined \$186,000		
Wayne	1988	Messercola, Louis	No Recall Election	Extortion	Resigned, prison		

<sup>\*</sup>Municipal Council Member

Interestingly, only one official- Matthews- was recalled.

In one unusual case, Millville Mayor Simon Cherivtch was convicted of tax evasion and was sentenced to one year and a day in prison.<sup>61</sup>

He never gave up his post and finished out his term once he left prison. Some voters talked about a recall while he was serving time but it never materialized.  $^{62}$ 

62 Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> "Recall of Mayor is Proposed by Millville Pastors," Courier-Post, February 11, 1950.

While some officials were recall targets because of their alleged corruption, Keansburg Mayor James Maher, ousted in 1927, apparently was too much of a do-gooder.<sup>63</sup>

"During Mayor Maher's term, peddle wheels, slot machines and other gambling devices were banned. Residents expressed their disapproval of his actions from time to time. He was regarded as a bit too much of a reformer." 64

What more likely did him in was the fact that the town's budget rose \$75,000- \$1.3 million in today's dollars- in one year under the mayor. 65

<sup>63 &</sup>quot;Mayor Beaten, City Manager Abandons Job," Trenton Evening Times, March 16, 1927.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Ibid.

<sup>65</sup> Ibid.

### **RECALLS BY MUNICIPALITY**

Few recalls have been successful in the state's largest cities. For instance, residents in Newark, the state's most populous municipality, have pushed out only one council member and that was in 1969.

In Newark's first and only recall election, Councilman Lee Bernstein was given early retirement after serving six years in office due in part to his support for bringing police dogs to the city and his opposition to sections of anti-poverty programs.<sup>66</sup>

None of the other nine members of the top ten municipalities by population- respectively, Jersey City, Paterson, Elizabeth, Lakewood, Edison, Woodbridge, Toms River, Trenton, or Hamilton Township (Mercer)- has ever held a recall election.

Table 5 Municipalities That Have Recalled More than One Official						
Municipality	County	Population**	Officials Recalled	Total Officials Targeted		
North Bergen	Hudson	60,612	14*	23		
Wildwood	Cape May	5,123	8	16		
Lodi	Bergen	26,620	7	24		
Asbury Park	Monmouth	15,002	7	28		
Avalon	Cape May	1,225	6	8		
Hackensack	Bergen	46,634	5*	30		
West New York	Hudson	53,552	5	14		
Keansburg	Monmouth	9,685	4	20		
River Vale	Bergen	10,062	3	3		
Hawthorne	Passaic	19,807	3	5		
Belleville	Essex	36,602	2	8		
Island Heights	Ocean	1,646	2	4		
Cape May City	Cape May	2,600	2	4		
Belmar	Monmouth	5,929	2	2		
Ridgefield Park	Bergen	13,324	2	11		
Fairfield	Essex	7,500	2	2		
Marlboro	Monmouth	39,874	2	2		

<sup>\*</sup>Recalled and reelected five officials in same election

<sup>\*\*</sup>https://worldpopulationreview.com/states/cities/new-jersey and census.gov; most data 2022

<sup>66 &</sup>quot;Lee Bernstein Ousted in Recall," Newark Star-Ledger, December 18, 1969.

North Bergen, which has recalled 14 officials while targeting 23, was termed "Recall City" in 1985.<sup>67</sup> In 1988, Hackensack, which has recalled five and targeted 30, was called the "recall capital of the nation." Hackensack is the place where residents have agitated the most for recall elections.

North Bergen at 14 has recalled the most officials. But it simultaneously reelected five in one election. So it has removed a net total of 9 officials. Tiny Wildwood also removed 8 officials through recall.

	Table 6 Municipalities Where Ten or More Officials Were Recall Targets							
City	Recalled	Not Recalled	No Election	Pending	Total Officials Targeted			
Hackensack	5	2	23		30			
Asbury Park	7	6	15		28			
Lodi	7	2	15		24			
North Bergen	14*	6	3		23			
Keansburg	4	4	12		20			
Long Branch		1	18		19			
Jersey City			17	1	18			
<b>Atlantic City</b>	1		15		16			
Wildwood	8		8		16			
West New York	5**		9		14			
Newark	1		12		13			
Ridgefield Park	2		9		11			

<sup>\*</sup>Five officials recalled but reelected at same time in 1978

Among the 12 municipalities that have had more than ten recall drives, three (Asbury Park, Long Branch and Keansburg) are in Monmouth County, three (Jersey City, North Bergen, West New York) are in Hudson County, three (Hackensack, Lodi, and Ridgefield Park) are in Bergen County, one (Wildwood) is Cape May County, one (Newark) is in Essex County and one (Atlantic City) is in Atlantic County.

<sup>\*\*</sup> Recalled but reelected at same time in 1993

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Fred Snowflack, "Peaceful Election in Recall City," The Record, July 17, 1985.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Ken Birnbaum, "Hackensack Anti-condo Group Files Recall Petitions," The Record, August 19, 1988.

## **RECALLS BY COUNTY**

Table 7 Recall Statistics by County/Statewide							
County	Recalled	Not Recalled	No Election	Current	Total Officials Targeted		
Hudson	19	11	42	1	73		
Bergen	18	10	77		105		
Cape May	17	7	21		45		
Monmouth	16	13	66		95		
Morris	6	4	34		44		
Essex	5	2	30	2	39		
Passaic	5		21		26		
Ocean	4	6	22	1	33		
Sussex	2		13		15		
Somerset	1		9		10		
Salem	1				1		
Atlantic	1		24		25		
Camden	1		13		14		
Warren			5		5		
Burlington		3	24		27		
Cumberland		1	8		9		
Gloucester		1	12		13		
Union			9		9		
Hunterdon			14		14		
Mercer			17		17		
Middlesex		2	23		25		
Statewide			5		5		
Totals	96	60	489	4	649		

### SCHOOL BOARD RECALLS REMAIN RARE

Early recall laws excluded school board members. The New Jersey Education Association called for extending the law to those officials in 1969.<sup>69</sup>

It didn't happen until voters approved a Constitutional Amendment including such recalls in 1993 and a statute was enacted in 1995.

Eighty-one school board members have been targeted for recall but only two were ousted and one survived a recall reelection.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> "School Board Recall Favored," United Press International story in Courier-Post, April 14, 1969.

### **NO NJ GUBERNATORIAL RECALLS**

New Jersey governors have been targets for recalls even before the law allowed it.

In 1976, a state senator from his own party suggested a push to recall Democratic Governor Brendan Byrne<sup>70</sup> even though the right didn't even exist at the time.

After Governor Jim Florio raised taxes in 1990, anti-tax group Hands Across New Jersey said it amassed more than 950,000 signatures calling for adoption of a state recall law and Florio's removal under it.<sup>71</sup> Florio was voted out of office in a 1993 regular election- two years before the recall law took effect.

Governor Christine Todd Whitman prompted "recall the governor" outcries from unionized state workers in 1994 before she enacted the first state recall law the next year.<sup>72</sup>

Since the new law took effect, four governors have been targeted by recall campaigns in New Jersey. None made it to the ballot.

Democratic Governor Jim McGreevey was the first target. In August 2003, a group of doctors, angered that he didn't support capping medical malpractice awards, began a recall drive against him.<sup>73</sup>

That same month, the Daily Record in Morris County ran a reader poll indicating 60.4 percent would vote to remove McGreevey.<sup>74</sup> On October 7, 2003 California voters ousted Democratic Governor Gray Davis by a lower margin.

The New Jersey recall fizzled. Its organizers were faced with the difficult task of gathering 1.1 million signatures in a state with 4.5 million registered voters. McGreevey resigned from office in 2004.

By contrast, the threshold in California to recall Davis was just under 900,000 voter signatures in a state with 15 million registered voters.<sup>75</sup> Backers there collected more than 1.6 million voter names.<sup>76</sup>

Democratic Governor Jon Corzine was next in 2008. His ill-fated plan to fix state finances by floating a \$40 billion bond issue and paying for it partly with higher tolls inflamed many voters. One-time Glen Ridge Mayor Carl Bergmanson, also a Democrat, led a drive to oust the governor but abandoned the effort after collecting fewer than 100,000 signatures.<sup>77</sup> In 2009, he ran against Corzine in the primary but netted just 17,129 votes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> "State Senator Rejects Byrne," Asbury Park Press, January 10, 1976.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Wayne King, "Tax Rally Displays Petitions Against Florio," New York Times, September 24, 1990.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> "NJ Pension Protest," Associated Press story in Press of Atlantic City, May 24, 1994.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Linda Johnson, "Doctors Targeting McGreevey, Other Democrats," Associated Press story in Daily Record, September 19, 2003.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> "Poll Results," Daily Record, August 9, 2003.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Available on California Secretary of State's website at https://www.sos.ca.gov/elections.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> "The Auditor- An Inside Look at the Week in New Jersey," The Star-Ledger, September 7, 2008.

Corzine was defeated by the Republican candidate- former U.S. Attorney Chris Christie.

Christie faced another aborted recall attempt in 2011 by the political organization, NJ-CAN. It was prompted by state and local public workers angered by the increase in cost of health and pension benefits.

In 2014 an article from *The Week* stated, "the signature total (1,377,762) is simply too high a barrier to get a recall moving against most officials. The real value to a recall campaign may be to force a resignation." Christie went on to serve two terms.

Current Governor Phil Murphy faced two recall efforts- one in 2019 and the second in 2020.

The first attempt led by Dr. Jenna M. Evans, Eric J. Shuttleworth, and Monica Brinson was approved by the Division of Elections April 18, 2019.<sup>79</sup> The governor's immigration policies were a key driver behind the effort.

The group had until only March 3, 2020 to collect 1,484,358 signatures and fell short though organizers had collected "approximately 1 million signatures." 80

The latter recall organized by Alexander Spielman, Carla J. Marras and Sharon M. Rubin was accepted by the Division of Elections December 21, 2020 but later rejected on technical grounds.<sup>81</sup>

Murphy was reelected in November 2021 and became the first Democrat to serve two consecutive terms since Brendan Byrne in the 1970s.

#### FEW LEGISLATORS TARGETED FOR RECALLS

No state legislator has been removed by recall since the 1995 law took effect making them eligible for removal.

Only two- former Senate President Steve Sweeney (D-Third District) in 2015 and former Senator Dawn Addiego (D-Eighth District) in 2019- faced organized recall drives as legislators. 82

While the recall campaigns failed, both were voted out of office in the regular 2021 legislative elections.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> "Why N.J. Won't Recall Chris Christie" www.theweek.com. January 27, 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Phil Stilton, "Petition to Recall New Jersey Governor Phil Murphy Approved by State," <u>www.shorenewsnetwork.com</u>, March 30, 2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Phil Stilton, "Phil Murphy Recall Didn't Get the Signatures But was a Success For New Jersey," www.shorenewsnetwork.com, March 12, 2020.

<sup>81 &</sup>quot;Phil Murphy Recall, Governor of New Jersey (2019-2020).

https://ballotpedia.org/Phil\_Murphy\_recall,\_Governor\_of\_New\_Jersey\_(2019-2020)#cite\_ref-email\_8-1.

<sup>82</sup> Some legislators who were dual office-holders have been targeted as local elected officials.

### **COUNTY OFFICIALS LARGELY SPARED RECALL HEADACHES**

Only a few county officials ever got on the recall radar.

Perhaps the best known was Peter Shapiro, a former Essex County Executive and state assembly member.

Shapiro in 1978 was a driving force behind creation of a county executive and then won the job without party organization support. In 1980 some active and former county officials started a recall committee. Raymond Durkin. After reporting it had nearly half of the 74,000 signatures needed to initiate a recall election, the group faded away after a call for Democratic unity by former Democratic County Chairman Raymond Durkin.

Shapiro went on to win the Democratic gubernatorial nomination in 1985 but was soundly defeated by incumbent Governor Tom Kean. After his loss to Kean, Shapiro lost his bid for a third term as county executive in 1986 and left politics.

Elected in 2008 and citing personal reasons, Hunterdon County Sheriff Deborah Trout announced she would not run for reelection in 2009.<sup>86</sup> Her announcement came after a recall attempt named outwithtrout.org failed to collect the required 21,866 valid signatures.<sup>87</sup>

Recall whispers involving Gerard Balmir circulated in Hudson County in 2015.<sup>88</sup> Balmir had become a county freeholder (now called commissioner) in 2014 with the support of Jersey City Mayor Steve Fulop. News accounts said he lost Fulop's support when Balmir's wife took a job with State Senate President Steve Sweeney.

Fulop and Sweeney were expected to square off in the Democratic primary election for governor in 2017 until eventual winner Phil Murphy jumped in with a heavily self-financed campaign that dissuaded them from running. No actual recall movement ever surfaced but Balmir in 2017 opted not to run for reelection.

-

<sup>83</sup> Donald Warshaw, "Shapiro Foes File to Launch Recall Drive," The Star-Ledger, February 1, 1980.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Richard S. Remington, "Few Backers Attend Shapiro Recall Talk," The Star-Ledger, March 28, 1980.

<sup>85</sup> Frederick W. Byrd, "Dem Chairman Girds for Busy Year," The Sunday Star-Ledger, June 15, 1980.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Michael Deak, "Hunterdon Sheriff Trout Declines to Run for Second Term," Courier News, September 22, 2009.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Walter O'Brien, "Petitioners Call It Quits on Trout Recall Efforts," Home News Tribune, June 17, 2009.

<sup>88</sup> Terrence T. McDonald, "Daunting Task for Any Dems Threatening Freeholder Recall," Jersey Journal, October 8, 2015.

### **RECENT RECALL ACTIVITY**

Chrissy Dye, who was serving her fourth term on the Cedar Grove Board of Education, resigned August 3, 2022 instead of facing a November recall election spurred by 3,000 residents who signed a petition seeking her ouster.<sup>89</sup>

The recall drive was spurred after the pre-K-12 school district, while Dye was board president, distributed a survey in 2021 asking students as young as nine about gender identity without first notifying parents. 90

Another school board member, Kerri Tillett of Mansfield Township (Burlington County), was the target of an unsuccessful recall drive in 2022. 91 She resigned in June after her family relocated to North Carolina. 92

Notices of recall attempts were filed <sup>93</sup> against Millburn Mayor Margaret "Maggee" Miggins and Township Committee member Sanjeev Vinayak. Some township residents are upset about their support for affordable housing. <sup>94</sup>

In Hoboken, citizens organized a committee to seek signatures for a petition to hold a recall election targeting Fifth Ward councilman Phil Cohen due to policy disagreements. 95 No signatures were submitted to the city clerk's office by November 28- the deadline for filing. 96

Some Jersey City residents talked openly in 2022 about recalling Jersey City At-Large Councilwoman Amy DeGise.<sup>97</sup> DeGise came under fire from some voters after being charged with a hit-and-run accident on July 19, 2022 with a man riding a bicycle.<sup>98</sup>

On January 24, 2023, DeGise pleaded guilty to leaving the scene of an accident in an Essex County court. She was sentenced to a one-year driver's license suspension and must pay a \$5,000 fine.

<sup>93</sup> Dated September 7 and 8, 2022 and retrieved from New Jersey Press Association database of public notices.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> David Wildstein, "Cedar Grove School Board Member Resigns to Avoid Recall Over Gender Identity Survey," New Jersey Globe, August 3, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Jackie Roman, "School Board Member Could Lose Seat Over Gender Survey," The Star-Ledger, July 26, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Melanie Burney, "After a Failed Recall Effort, a South Jersey School Board's Vacant Seat is Filled- For Now," Philadelphia Inquirer, September 12, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Elise Phillips Margulis, "Residents will be Circulating a Petition to Recall Miggins and Vinayak," <a href="www.patch.com">www.patch.com</a>, September 4, 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> John Heinis, "3 Hoboken 5<sup>th</sup> Ward Residents File Notice of Intention to Recall Councilman Phil Cohen," Hudson County View, May 24, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> John Heinis, "Hoboken 5<sup>th</sup> Ward Councilman Cohen Announces Reelection Bid After Recall Fizzles Out," Hudson County View, November 28,2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Joshua Rosario, "Hudson Progressives Eye Recall Election for Hit-and-Run Councilwoman's Seat as Calls for Resignation Dwindle," Jersey Journal, September 9, 2022.

<sup>98</sup> Joshua Rosario, "City Councilwoman Cited in Hit-and-Run Crash with Cyclist," The Star-Ledger, July 21, 2022.

While more than 6,000 residents reportedly have signed a petition urging her resignation, <sup>99</sup> recall organizers would need more than 42,000 valid signatures to trigger a recall election. <sup>100</sup>

DeGise's critics seem to recognize this reality although they said they will keep urging her to resign. "...a recall of DeGise doesn't seem likely as there have never been successful recalls in Jersey City." 101

Of the 18 Jersey City officials where the threat of recall has arisen, not one has been recalled by voters though a municipal commissioner in 1927 did resign.

More recently, a group of Plumsted residents has said it plans to seek the recall of Rev. Dominick Cuozzo, a township committee member. Recall advocates say the official's "personal and religious beliefs have taken priority over the needs and wants of the overall community." 103

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Nancy Solomon and Louis C. Hochman, "How NJ Makes it Hard to Recall a Scandal-plagued Politician Like Jersey City's Amy Degise," Gothamist, August 21, 2022.
<sup>100</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Joshua Rosario, "DeGise's Plea in Hit-and-Run Gives Hudson Progressives Renewed Hope," Jersey Journal, January 26, 2023.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> David Wildstein, NJ Globe, "Cuozzo Facing Recall in Plumsted," February 3, 2023.

<sup>103</sup> Ibid.

### EFFORT TO RECALL U.S. SENATOR INVALIDATES PART OF LAW

The New Jersey recall process encountered a major challenge in 2009 after Roseann Salanitri, a Sussex County Republican, a former legal secretary and self-proclaimed housewife, formed a group to recall U.S. Senator Robert Menendez (D-NJ). Its members included Tea Party activists and conservatives who were angry over bank bail outs and increases in health-care costs due to Obama administration legislation.

They chose to pursue the recall of Menendez as opposed to Senator Frank Lautenberg (D-NJ) because the latter was "in his 80s with stomach cancer while Menendez was 30 years his junior in good health with a long career ahead of him" according to Salanitri. <sup>104</sup>

The Tea Party effort quickly floundered when Secretary of State Nina Wells rejected the recall notice in September 2009. Wells said the notice of recall should have been approved before the collection of petition signatures began.<sup>105</sup>

After consulting with the state Attorney General, Wells also maintained that the U.S. Constitution, which doesn't allow for the recall of federal offices, superseded the provision in the State Constitution.

Until the efforts of Salanitri and the Sussex County Tea Party group, no recall effort had been made against a United States Senator as there was uncertainty surrounding the issue. 106

In March 2010, a three-judge Appellate Division panel ruled in *Committee to Recall Robert Menendez v. Wells, 413 N.J. Super. 435 (App. Div. 2010)* that Wells violated the law by rejecting the group's notice of intention.

The judges said while her reason for rejection- that the recall was in violation of the U.S. Constitution- might turn out to be true, there was enough uncertainty to allow the group to proceed with its effort unless it was overridden by high courts. <sup>107</sup>

The matter was appealed to the New Jersey Supreme Court.

During the subsequent New Jersey Supreme Court hearing on the constitutionality of recalling U.S. Senators, Andrew Schlafly, lawyer for the Sussex Tea Party group, attempted to use a letter written by George Washington to support his case.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Cynthia Burton, "Justices Hear Menendez Recall Effort," Philadelphia Inquirer, May 26, 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> Ibid.

 <sup>106</sup> Cynthia Burton, "N.J. Supreme Court Hears Tea Party's Push to Recall Menendez," Philadelphia Inquirer, May 26, 2010.
 107 Henry Gottlieb, "Sidestepping Recall Law's Legality. Court Lets Menendez Foes Proceed," New Jersey Law Journal, March 22, 2010.

The letter dated November 10, 1787, was addressed to Washington's nephew, Bushrod Washington. It states that when officials act against the people's wishes "their Servants can, and undoubtedly will be, recalled." <sup>108</sup>

Noted election law specialist Marc Elias, a lawyer for Menendez, relied on sentiments expressed by other founding fathers. He insisted the framers of the U.S. Constitution barred recall elections so senators could debate nationally important issues without such distractions. <sup>109</sup>

He went on to argue that the issue of recall had already been dealt with in 1906 by the U.S. Supreme Court in *Burton v. United States*, 202 U.S. 344 (1906), which concluded that an involuntary vacancy in the U.S. Senate occurs only by death, expiration of office, or discipline such as expulsion. <sup>110</sup>

Efforts to recall Senator Menendez were officially thwarted on November 18, 2010, when the New Jersey Supreme Court ruled 4-2 that no federal Constitutional provision allowed for the recall of a U.S. Senator 204 N.J. 79 (2010).

The Court also affirmed that the parts in the state Constitution and Uniform Election Recall Law (UREL), which allowed for voters to recall members of Congress, were unconstitutional.

Laws pertaining to the recall of state and local officials were allowed to remain in place. 111

The majority didn't feel the personal letter of Washington superseded the Federalist Papers or 1787 Constitutional Convention where Alexander Hamilton and James Madison rejected the idea of recall.

"...a private letter to a family member can hardly outweigh open, public debate at the conventions," said Chief Justice Stuart Rabner. 112

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> George Washington, Letter: "From George Washington to Bushrod Washington. 9 November 1787." Founders.archives.gov.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Michael Booth, "U.S., N.J. Constitution in Conflict in Menendez Recall Case," New Jersey Law Journal, May 31, 2010. <sup>110</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Peggy Ackerman, "Tea Party Lawsuit Fails to Remove Menendez," The Star Ledger, November 19, 2010. Committee to Remove Robert Menendez v. Wells, A-86-09, November 18, 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Michael Booth, "NJ High Court Turns Back Tea Party's Bid to Recall Sen. Robert Menendez," New Jersey Law Journal, November 22, 2010.

### Presidential Recall Never Got Off the Ground

While courts have ruled that federal representatives cannot be recalled under the current Constitution, U.S. Senator Robert Hendrickson from Woodbury, New Jersey in 1951 proposed a constitutional amendment to allow recall of a President.

As an Army veteran who served in both world wars, he introduced his bill after President Harry Truman had fired General Douglas MacArthur. 113

Hendrickson's bill, which would have enabled the recall of a president when two thirds of the states felt the leader had lost voter support, never got traction.

The former state senator and treasurer served just one term as U.S. Senator after which he was named ambassador to New Zealand by Dwight D. Eisenhower.

. .

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Tom Murse, "Why a President Cannot be Recalled," October 8, 2020, https://www.thoughtco.com/why-a-recall-wontwork-3367929.

	Table 8 National Recall Election Chronology
1787	President George Washington writes letter expressing support for recalls but the idea is rejected during a Constitutional Convention that same year.
1989	San Diego, California includes the right to recall in its charter.
1904	The recall of a Los Angeles, California councilman is the first recall in America.
1908	Oregon adopts first statewide right to recall.
1921	North Dakota voters recall Governor Lynn Frazier though he later goes on to become one of the state's U.S. Senators.
2003	California voters recall Governor Gray Davis, the second of only two governors ever recalled nationally.
2021	In one of the most expensive elections in American history, California Governor Gavin Newsom survives recall. It cost candidates and government agencies about \$350 million.
2022	In the first successful recall in San Francisco since 1914, local voters remove three school board members.

### HISTORICAL ROOTS OF RIGHT TO RECALL

The first recorded attempts to recall elected officials in America pre-date the nation's founding. The right was first observed within the laws of the General Court of the Massachusetts Bay Colony in 1631. It arises again through a proposal from Edmund Randolph's *Virginia Plan* during the Constitutional Convention of 1787.

Despite gaining support from other delegates, the Federalists defeated the proposal with Alexander Hamilton voicing the greatest opposition. He stated that the right to recall, "will render the senator a slave to all the capricious humors among the people." <sup>114</sup>

After its defeat at the Constitutional Convention of 1787, the idea of recall was put on the shelf for virtually the entire 19<sup>th</sup> century. Not until the Progressive Era at the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century was recall as a concept again discussed seriously.

The modern right to recall was born in California, which also has generated the most recalls based on records kept by www.ballotpedia.com and the secretary of state's office.

San Diego appears to have been the first jurisdiction to include recall in its charter adopted in 1889. 115

Recall became better known because of the recall movement that sprung up in Los Angeles in response to Southern Pacific Railroad's domination of California politics.

Philadelphia-transplant and physician John Randolph Haynes proposed the idea of recall in 1898 and it made its way to a new city charter for Los Angeles.

After the charter was ratified and the Legislature approved it, Los Angeles adopted the right to recall in 1903. 116

Los Angeles conducted its first recall election in 1904 when a city councilman was tossed from office. By 1911, 25 other cities in California had adopted a recall procedure. 117

At the state level, the first recall law was adopted through a referendum in Oregon in June 1908 establishing the voter right. 118

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Joshua Spivak, "What Is the History of Recall Elections? "Historynewsnetwork.org. Undated.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Joshua Spivak, "Recall Elections: From Alexander Hamilton to Gavin Newsom," 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Ibid.

### **CURRENT NATIONAL PERSPECTIVE**

Currently 19 states and the District of Columbia permit the recall of state officials, according to the National Conference of State Legislatures. <sup>119</sup> These states are Alaska, Arizona, California, Colorado, Georgia, Idaho, Illinois, Kansas, Louisiana, Michigan, Minnesota, Montana, Nevada, New Jersey, North Dakota, Oregon, Rhode Island, Washington, and Wisconsin.

In all these states except for Montana, the right to recall is in the state Constitution. Montana allows the procedure via a state statute. In the late 2010s, recall proposals were considered but did not pass the legislatures of New York, West Virginia, Connecticut, and Oklahoma. Virginia allows for a recall trial rather than election where if enough signatures are gathered, a circuit court decides whether a targeted official can stay in office. According to the National Conference on State Legislatures, at least 30 and as many as 38 states empower voters to remove local officials as well. 120

### FEW GOVERNORS OR STATE LEGISLATORS RECALLED NATIONALLY

The first of just two successful recall elections against a governor targeted North Dakota's Republican Governor Lynn Frazier. 121 He was a Republican backed by the progressive Nonpartisan League because he worked with the Legislature to adopt many progressive measures.

His popularity faded in the early 1920s when the North Dakota economy fell into a recession. The state started to run a deficit, the state-owned bank almost went bankrupt, and private banks in North Dakota refused to help. In the first recall election against a governor, North Dakota voters booted out Frazier and, by just 4,000 votes, elected a more conservative Republican to take his place. State Attorney General William Lemke and the agriculture commissioner also were removed from office in this election.

One unpredictable aspect of recalls is they are not always a political death sentence.

In 1922, Frazier was elected to the first of three terms in the U.S. Senate and a decade later Lemke was elected to Congress where he served five terms.

The second and only other governor felled by a recall election was California Democratic Governor Gray Davis. 122 He was targeted in 2003 after surviving a close general election campaign in 2002 in the wake of higher state taxes and energy shortages. In California, recall ballots separately ask whether the current official should be removed and who should replace that person.

<sup>121</sup> Joshua Spivak, "Recall Elections: From Alexander Hamilton to Gavin Newsom," 2021.

<sup>119</sup> https://www.ncsl.org/research/elections-and-campaigns/recall-of-state-officials.aspx downloaded 7/8/22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Joshua Spivak, "Recall Elections: From Alexander Hamilton to Gavin Newsom," 2021.

The 2003 ballot attracted a dizzying and colorful field of 135 candidates, including porn stars and a former child TV star, among others. Davis was removed by the October recall and replaced by Austrianborn actor Arnold Schwarzenegger, who later was elected to a full term in 2006.

According to the National Conference of State Legislatures, only 29 state legislators have been targeted by recall efforts since 1913. Twenty-two have been recalled- six in Wisconsin, five in California, three each in Oregon and Michigan, two each in Idaho and Colorado and one in Arizona. Two leaders were recalled- Senate Presidents in Arizona and Colorado.

### **CALIFORNIA- EPICENTER FOR POLITICAL EARTHQUAKES**

California is the most populous state and has a long tradition of direct voter democracy.

"In this wifty world of Golden State politics, propositions get more consideration than candidates and staging a recall election is easier than getting across Los Angeles on the Santa Monica Freeway." <sup>123</sup>

The right to recall state officials was approved through initiative and referendum in 1911. Two years later, in 1913, voters ousted a state Senator from office in the state's first recall election.

According to information available from the California Secretary of State's office and www.ballotpedia.com, there have been 179 recall attempts of state elected officials plus 414 local officials.

Governors, including former California Governor and U.S. President Ronald Reagan and most recently Governor Gavin Newsom, have been the most frequent targets with 55 attempts. Several were targeted multiple times. Opponents also took aim at 80 state legislators. Twenty-seven state Supreme court members were targeted and in 1966, someone tried to oust all seven Supreme Court members in one election.

Despite all these attempts, only 11 recalls of state officials have made it to the ballot. Of those, voters hit the eject button for just one governor and five legislators.

Recall attempts against state and local officials in California have been national news during the past year.

In September 2021, with voters greatly unsettled due to the COVID-19 pandemic, a recall vote on Democratic Governor Gavin Newsom took place. It led to one of the most expensive state elections in American history.

Newsom was luckier than Gray Davis as he survived by a 62 to 38 percent margin. Newsom and his allies against the recall spent a combined \$91.7 million versus \$20 million by supporters.

NJ Election Law Enforcement Commission White Paper No. 30

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Karen Heller, "Recallifornia-it is- Let's Hope that the Contagion Afflicting the Trend-Boasting Golden State Won't Travel East," Philadelphia Inquirer, August 24, 2003.

#### RECALL ELECTIONS NATIONALLY

There was a long slate of 53 candidates on the replacement ballot. It was won by conservative talk show host Larry Elder. Since Newsom won the recall election, the replacement outcome was moot.

The overall cost of the two-part election was staggering- almost \$150 million spent by candidates and committees on the recall and replacement races plus \$200 million spent by government agencies to hold the election. Newsom won reelection to a second term in 2022 with about 59 percent of the vote.

The pandemic also led to increases in crime, particularly quality of life crimes across the country. This upset some California voters whose district attorneys were elected on progressive platforms.

San Francisco's Chesa Boudin was recalled by voters in June 2022. 124 However, efforts to recall Los Angeles District Attorney George Gascon fell short. 125

San Francisco voters also recalled three school board members in February 2022, in part due to the slowness of reopening schools during the pandemic. This was the first time San Francisco voters ever voted to recall school board members and was the first successful recall since 1914 in that city.

#### OTHER STATES WITH NOTABLE RECALLS

Other states with notable recall elections include Arizona, Florida, Michigan and Wisconsin.

As protests against COVID-19 restrictions increased in 2020 and 2021 there were recall efforts made against several governors. Most notable was Gretchen Whitmer, a Michigan Democrat faced 34 recall attempts during those years, none of which made the ballot. She was reelected to a second term in 2022 with 54 percent of the vote.

In 2011, Carlos Alvarez, Mayor of Miami-Dade County, Florida, was recalled. <sup>126</sup> No previous mayor subject to recall represented more people. At the time, the Miami-Dade's population was more than 2.5 million. <sup>127</sup>

Wisconsin was also the home of numerous progressive reforms. But after the 2010 elections, conservative Republicans swept the state and newly elected Governor, Scott Walker, made deep cuts to the state budget as well as curtailing the bargaining rights of public employee unions. This alienated Wisconsin's unionized public work force as well as labor groups nationally.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Erin Doherty and Nick Bastone, "San Fransico District Attorney Chesa Boudin Recalled," Axios.com, June 7, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Jeremy White, "LA District Attorney Recall Fails to Qualify For Ballot," Politico, August 15, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Lizette Alvarez, "Miami-Dade County Mayor is Removed," The New York Times, March 16, 2011.

<sup>127</sup> https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/miamidadecountyflorida.FL#

#### RECALL ELECTIONS NATIONALLY

In 2011, six Republican and three Democratic senators were placed on the ballot. All three Democrats won but two GOP legislators lost. 128 It was the single largest recall attempt in U.S. history in terms of number of candidates. 129

In recall elections held in 2012, Walker, his lieutenant governor and three of four Republican Senate members won. <sup>130</sup> Walker was reelected in 2014 before losing in the 2018 general election.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Joshua Spivak, "Recall Elections: From Alexander Hamilton to Gavin Newsom," 2021.

<sup>129 &</sup>quot;Recall Election," http://www.britannica.com.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Joshua Spivak, "Recall Elections: From Alexander Hamilton to Gavin Newsom," 2021.

The right to recall is a form of direct democracy that allows voters to directly participate in local and state politics and hold elected officials accountable.

The question is whether recalls are more of a citizen safety valve than an empty threat.

The answer- it depends.

Recalls in New Jersey are largely a numbers game. The bigger the voting district, the less likely officials will face early removal.

In October 1995, Michael A. Pane, then-counsel to the New Jersey State League of Municipalities, wrote that the new state law extending the right to recall to state and federal elected officials would lead to few, if any, ousters.

"It is fair to say that the law, as it is structured, is written so as to allow the right to recall while making that right almost impossible to use," he said. "Mounting a successful recall effort at a state or even a legislative district level would seem to be a Herculean task." <sup>131</sup>

More than a quarter-century later, his comments turned out to be prophetic.

Governors, state legislators and county officials, which have much larger numbers of voters within their districts than many local officials, have avoided recall elections. While U.S. Senators and representatives also have large districts, judges have decided they can't be targeted for recall under the U.S. Constitution.

Recalls are easier to achieve in places with fewer voters and therefore offer local voters some chance of kicking out bad officials. The average population of the 56 municipalities that recalled 96 officials is just under 25,000. Nearly half are under 10,000. Only seven are more than 50,000.

Even among municipalities, recalls have become less frequent under the 1995 law. That is partly because earlier laws allowed recall elections based on 25 percent of the previous general election vote, which is a much smaller number than 25 percent of registered voters.

In the 28 years since its passage, 14 local officials have been recalled after 257 tries- about a 5 percent chance. Before 1995, 82 officials were recalled after 392 tries- a 21 percent chance.

In the 1980s, which was the hottest decade for recalls, 19 were recalled in just ten years.

Recall campaigns and elections were uncommon even before 1995 but also were more successful.

1 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Michael A. Pane, "The New Recall Law: Will All Petitions End in Litigation?," New Jersey Municipalities magazine, October 1995.

In the 1920s, the recall success rate was 35 percent. It fell to 27 percent in the 1930s, dipping to 14 percent in the 1970s. During the hottest decade for recalls, when there were 19, the figure climbed to 25 percent.

Following enactment of the 1995 law, the success rate has fallen steadily to a low of one percent during the 2010s. So far there have been no recalls in this decade.

Even though the 1995 law made it harder to secure a recall election, it has spurred more recall drives.

The largest number of officials ever targeted in a single decade- 111- happened during the 2000s. The success rate for that period was 10 percent.

	Table 9 Number of Recall Attempts and Recalls by Decade										
Decade	<b>Recall Attempts</b>	Recalled	Recall Success								
1910s	25	0	0%								
1920s	23	8	35%								
1930s	22	6	27%								
1940s	23	5	22%								
1950s	28	6	21%								
1960s	60	12	20%								
1970s	88	12	14%								
1980s	75	19	25%								
1990s	87	16	18%								
2000s	111	11	10%								
2010s	80	1	1%								
2020s	27	None	0%								
Totals	649	96	15%								

Ben Dworkin, now Director of Rowan Institute for Public Policy and Citizenship, said "a recall effort is a tremendous undertaking. It involves securing a large number of signatures of registered voters and takes a great amount of grassroots effort. If you are going to successfully recall an official like a mayor, you have to really want it." <sup>132</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> Matt Fair, "Recall Petition Filed," The Times (Trenton), June 7, 2011.

One purpose of this report, which is thought to contain the most extensive analysis ever of New Jersey recall election information, is to provide real world perspective for current or future policy-makers who might want to change New Jersey's recall laws.

Recalls should not be easy or else they would make a mockery of elections. They also can discourage civic courage.

A 1993 Daily Record editorial noted: "Recall discourages leadership, which is already in short supply. Sometimes it is important for officials to take unpopular positions or go out on a limb." <sup>133</sup>

On the other hand, some legislators have recognized that the current process might be too difficult.

Seeking to lower the petition threshold, a new constitutional amendment, ACR214 was introduced January 13, 2009 and sponsored by Assemblyman Wayne DeAngelo (D-Hamilton).

He made a push for the proposal in 2012 when a local mayor was facing bribery charges. "The public has a right to seek to remove elected officials from office if there is an overwhelming or clear demonstration that the official is not fulfilling their duties and responsibilities for the betterment of the community," DeAngelo said in the statement. "The recall process should not be such an intimidating procedure that the residents throw up their hands and become resigned to the fact that their representative that does not serve them effectively (can't be removed)." <sup>134</sup>

Under the proposal, a recall election once again could be held if signatures were gathered from 25 percent of those who voted in the most recent general election in the relevant district. For a governor, the district would be the entire state. For a legislator, it would be the legislative district. For the mayor, the election district would be the municipal boundaries.

A national expert on recalls has said: "A threshold of 25 to 30 percent of those who cast ballots in the previous general election should be adequate to dissuade the use of the recall for partisan spite." 135

DeAngelo's bill also would allow recall attempts to begin 90 days before an official's first anniversary in office instead of 50 days. <sup>136</sup> While the legislator reintroduced his legislation every session except for the current one, it has never been subject to even a single committee hearing.

The reform legislation reflected the fact that most states with recall base signature requirements on votes cast in the previous election, not registered voters.

The number of registered voters is far higher than the number of votes cast.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> Editorial, Daily Record, November 10, 1993.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Matthew Arco, "DeAngelo Poised to Introduce Recall Reform Measures," Observer.com, May 9, 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Joseph F. Zimmerman, "The Recall- Tribunal of the People," ABC-CLIO, October 10, 1997.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Erin Duffy, "Lawmaker: Ease Recall Rules. DeAngelo to Offer Bill that Reduces "Daunting" Burden on Petitioners," The Times (Trenton), May 10, 2012.

For instance, in the November 2, 2021 election, the number of registered voters was 6,545,250 while only 2,648,814 votes were cast, according to the state Division of Elections.

Based on those numbers, present law would require 1,636,312 signatures from registered voters to put a gubernatorial recall election on the ballot. Under the lower threshold, it would take 662,203 signatures- still a significant number but just 40 percent of the existing requirement.

Fourteen states use votes cast while five, including New Jersey, use registered voters. California uses both depending on the office.

Table 10 Signature Threshold Requirements for Recall Petitions									
State	% of Votes Cast	% of Registered Voters							
New Jersey		25							
Alaska	25								
Arizona	25								
California*	12-20	10-30							
Colorado	25								
Georgia		15-30							
Idaho		20							
Illinois**	15								
Kansas	40								
Louisiana		20-40							
Michigan	25								
Minnesota	25								
Montana		10-15							
Nevada	25								
North Dakota	25								
Oregon	15								
Rhode Island	15								
Washington	25-35								
Wisconsin	25								

<sup>\*</sup>Thresholds for votes cast apply to state officials while those based on registered voters apply to local officials

Source: National Conference of State Legislatures

The late State Senator William Schluter (R-Hunterdon), co-sponsor of the 1994 recall constitutional amendment, supported DeAngelo's desire for revisions but differed on the details.

<sup>\*\*</sup>Also requires signatures of at least 20 members of House and 10 members of Senate with at least half from same party

Schluter wanted to keep relying on registered votes to qualify recall petitions while dropping the percentage from 25 percent to 12 or 15 percent.<sup>137</sup>

The Legislature has shown no recent appetite to revamp the recall process in New Jersey. Should that change, the overview provided in this report hopefully will be useful in any re-evaluation.

In the meantime, ELEC will continue to regulate campaign finance activity associated with recall elections. Since 1990, at least 123 recall committees have filed reports with the agency.

Under ELEC regulations, targets of recalls and recall organizers both can set up committees to raise and spend funds. Contribution limits that apply to candidates also apply to recall committees. For instance, an individual, corporation or union can contribute \$2,600 for each recall election.

ELEC provides a manual to explain requirements for recall elections:

https://www.elec.nj.gov/pdffiles/forms/compliance/comp\_recall.pdf

As a follow-up to this report, ELEC will try to make it easier to retrieve recall reports via the agency's website. Most recall elections currently are buried among other "special elections," which include elections on ballot questions and filling vacancies.

127			
13/	Ibid		

\_

#### HOW INFORMATION WAS COMPILED FOR THIS REPORT

Lists of 649 recall targets and 80 elections compiled in this report are believed to be the most comprehensive available. No organization has ever kept records on all recall elections. Online reports on ELEC's website related to recall elections date back to only 1990. Even some of those are unavailable because files were destroyed under state record retention laws. In addition, recall organizers or their targets don't always file reports with ELEC.

In seeking to document recall movements predating ELEC filing requirements, ELEC searched thousands of news stories using online archives of more than 80 sources. Those publications ranged as large as the New York Times to a tiny, long-defunct weekly Wildwood newspaper called Five Mile Beach Journal.

Other research sources included www.ballotpedia.com and recallelections.blogspot.com, which catalog recall information by state, paper news clippings available from the state library, as well information available on the National Conference of State Legislatures website.

Today's online research tools are incredibly powerful. Yet this report still might not contain every recall drive or election that occurred in New Jersey. More than 100 years is a long period to research. Most searches that were done used the phrase "recall election" rather than just "recall" because the latter option called up far too many irrelevant stories. Recall attempts in small towns might not have received news coverage.

Another challenge was to decide what recall drives should be included for statistical purposes. ELEC found a wide range in terms of their seriousness. Twenty-nine examples were excluded for various reasons. Most were cases where recalls were called for at public meetings or in letters to newspapers with no follow-through. Also left out were some older elections, particularly one 1939 Trenton contest, described as "recall elections" that were change of government elections where no officials were targets.

ELEC's lists include recall elections that happened, recall drives verified by reports filed with ELEC, other drives that began in earnest but failed to meet petition requirements, and some where there seemed to be more than just casual intent to recall a candidate even if it ultimately fizzled.

In some cases, officials faced more than one recall drive but the official's name is listed only once as a target.

Decisions by recall targets to resign or not run for reelection are noted though in some cases, officials cited other reasons for stepping down. Efforts also were made to find out if recall victims were later reelected or voted out in the next regular election.

Given the scope of this project, mistakes may have occurred despite repeated fact-checking.

In the event of such errors, or if ELEC's analysis missed some recall elections or drives, please contact Deputy Director Joseph Donohue at 609-292-8700.

NUMBER	LOCATION	COUNTY	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME
1	Deal	Monmouth	1914	Levy, William	Mayor	Not Recalled
2	Bradley Beach	Monmouth	1916	Macdonald, William E.	Mayor	Not Recalled
3	Wildwood	Cape May	1921	Hendee, W.C.	Mayor	Recalled
	Wildwood	Cape May	1921	Smith, Frank E.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
	Wildwood	Cape May	1921	Bright, Oliver	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
4	Long Branch	Monmouth	1922	Zartman, Samuel E.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
5	Avalon	Cape May	1925	Smith, Gilbert	Mayor	Recalled
	Avalon	Cape May	1925	Barron, William	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
	Avalon	Cape May	1925	Canfield, F.P.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
6	Keansburg	Monmouth	1927	Maher, James P.	Mayor	Recalled
7	Ocean City	Cape May	1929	Champion, Joseph G. Mayor		Not Recalled
8	Hawthorne	Passaic	1929	Mason, Peter	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
9	Teaneck	Bergen	1933	Morten, Louis G.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
	Teaneck	Bergen	1933	Paquin, Samuel	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
	Teaneck	Bergen	1933	Van Wagner, Carl D.	Mayor	Not Recalled
	Teaneck	Bergen	1933	Warner, Frederick T.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
10	Keansburg	Monmouth	1934	Franck, A.A.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
	Keansburg	Monmouth	1934	Martin, Jacob F.S.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
	Keansburg	Monmouth	1934	Turner, William	Mayor	Not Recalled
11	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1935	Croce, Louis P.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1935	Digney, James J.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1935	Henry, Sidney L.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1935	Silverstein, Dr. Max	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
12	Wildwood	Cape May	1938	Bradway, Doris	Mayor	Recalled
	Wildwood	Cape May	1938	McMurray, Frederick	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled

NUMBER	LOCATION	COUNTY	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME
13	Avalon	Cape May	1941	Becker, Edward B.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
	Avalon	Cape May	1941	Joiner, William C.H.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
14	North Bergen	Hudson	1949	Cullum, Paul F.	Mayor	Recalled
	North Bergen	Middlesex	1949	Fugman, Jr., Anthony	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
	North Bergen	Hudson	1949	Roe, John J.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
15	Keansburg	Monmouth	1950	Brennan, Felix J.	Mayor	Not Recalled
16	Parsippany- Troy Hills	Morris	1956	Manning, Edward V.	Mayor	Not Recalled
	Parsippany- Troy Hills	Morris	1956	Council Member 1	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
	Parsippany- Troy Hills	Morris	1956	Council Member 2	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
	Parsippany- Troy Hills	Morris	1956	Council Member 3	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
17	Long Beach	Ocean	1957	Graham, Wils T.	Mayor	Recalled
	Long Beach	Ocean	1957	Parker, Ralph	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
18	Hackensack	Bergen	1959	Bosshard, Harry P.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled***
	Hackensack	Bergen	1959	Deuell, Edgar P.	Mayor	Recalled
	Hackensack	Bergen	1959	Feber, Herman S.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Hackensack	Bergen	1959	Frapaul, Peter	Municipal Council Member	Recalled***
	Hackensack	Bergen	1959	Voorhis, Nichols	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
19	Lodi	Bergen	1960	Cuccia, Joseph	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Lodi	Bergen	1960	Focarino, Bernard	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
	Lodi	Bergen	1960	Luna, Joseph	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Lodi	Bergen	1960	Melango, Louis	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Lodi	Bergen	1960	Scibetta, John	Mayor	Recalled
20	Hackensack	Bergen	1963	Wysocki, Kazmier	Mayor	Not Recalled
	Hackensack	Bergen	1963	Freeman, Charles R.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled

NUMBER	LOCATION	COUNTY	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME
21	Belleville	Essex	1964	Addonizio, G. George	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Belleville	Essex	1964	Laterza, Robert	Mayor	Recalled
	Belleville	Essex	1964	Strumolo, Vincent	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
22	Ridgefield Park	Bergen	1965	Wagner, Jr. Willam A.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled**
	Ridgefield Park	Bergen	1965	Windecker, Louis E.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled**
23	Harvey Cedars	Ocean	1966	Thomas, Reynold	Mayor	Not Recalled
	Harvey Cedars	Ocean	1966	Hill, J. Michael	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
24	Cape May Point	Cape May	1967	Chomiak, Michael	Mayor	Recalled
25	West Cape May	Cape May	1967	Smith, Edward L.	Mayor	Not Recalled
26	Marlboro	Monmouth	1968	Creevy, George E.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Marlboro	Monmouth	1968	Storer, Alfred L.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
27	Newark	Essex	1969	Bernstein, Lee	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
28	North Bergen	Hudson	1969	Sarubbi, Angelo J.	Mayor	Not Recalled
	North Bergen	Hudson	1969	Weaver, Charles J.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
	North Bergen	Hudson	1969	Jialdini, Joseph J.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
	North Bergen	Hudson	1969	Steinel, Jr. Charles J.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
	North Bergen	Hudson	1969	Burger, George E. Jr.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
29	Beach Haven	Ocean	1972	Pharo, Watson	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
30	Union City	Hudson	1972	Calandrillo, Harry	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
	Union City	Hudson	1972	Clark, Frank	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
	Union City	Hudson	1972	Logarmarsino, James	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
	Union City	Hudson	1972	Lombardo, Paul	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
	Union City	Hudson	1972	Meehan, Frank	Mayor	Not Recalled

NUMBER	LOCATION	COUNTY	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME
31	Fairfield	Essex	1974	DeBella, Samuel	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Fairfield	Essex	1974	Puglisi, Joseph	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
32	Spotswood	Middlesex	1974	Brundage, Donald	Mayor	Not Recalled
	Spotswood	Middlesex	1974	Dubester, Nathan	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
33	Lodi	Bergen	1975	Bombase, John	Mayor	Recalled
	Lodi	Bergen	1975	Direnzo, Alfred M.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Lodi	Bergen	1975	Warchol, George	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
34	Avalon	Cape May	1978	Riggall, Lloyd	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
35	North Bergen	Hudson	1978	Affuso, Ralph	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled**
	North Bergen	Hudson	1978	Brady, William V.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled**
	North Bergen	Hudson	1978	Duffy, John J.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled**
	North Bergen	Hudson	1978	Mocco, Peter	Mayor	Recalled**
	North Bergen	Hudson	1978	Pinto, Alfonso	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled**
36	Sea Isle City	Cape May	1978	Kehner, William	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
37	West Milford	Passaic	1979	Sambraus, Richard J.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
38	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1980	Albarelli, Ascenzio	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1980	English, Edward R.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1980	Harris, Lorenzo W.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1980	Kramer, Ray	Mayor	Not Recalled
	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1980	Zachary, Henrietta L.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
39	Millville	Cumberland	1980	Aronoff, Ethan W.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
40	North Bergen	Hudson	1980	Bier, Bernard	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
	North Bergen	Hudson	1980	Dolan, George	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
	North Bergen	Hudson	1980	Duffy, John	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled

NUMBER	LOCATION	COUNTY	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME
	North Bergen	Hudson	1980	DiVincent, Anthony	Mayor	Not Recalled
	North Bergen	l	1980	Fortunato, Nicholas "Smokey"	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
41	Island Heights	Ocean	1981	Kushner, Howard	Mayor	Recalled
42	Pequannock	Morris	1981	Glinbizzi, Nathaniel "Nate"	Mayor	Recalled
43	Morristown	Morris	1982	Cline, William	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
44	Keansburg	Monmouth	1983	Currie, Robert T.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Keansburg	Monmouth	1983	Kauffmann, George E.	Mayor	Recalled***
	Keansburg	Monmouth	1983	Lloyd, Eileen	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
45	Passaic	Passaic	1983	Hare, Robert	Mayor	Recalled
46	Stafford	Ocean	1983	Bell, Wesley K.	Mayor	Recalled
47	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1984	Kramer, Ray	Mayor	Not Recalled
48	Atlantic City	Atlantic	1984	Matthews, Michael	Mayor	Recalled
49	Deptford	Gloucester	1984	Kivlen, Joseph J.	Mayor	Not Recalled
50	Wildwood	Cape May	1984	Ostrander, Earl B.	Mayor	Recalled
51	Island Heights	Ocean	1985	Bloom, Jospeh	Mayor	Recalled
52	North Bergen	Hudson	1985	Hass, Charles	Mayor	Recalled
	North Bergen	Hudson	1985	Nadler, Marvin	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
53	Avalon	Cape May	1986	Sloan, Rachel H.	Mayor	Not Recalled
54	Rockaway	Morris	1986	Wojtaszek, John	Mayor	Recalled
55	Bordentown City	Burlington County	1987	Bowker, Joseph	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
	Bordentown City	Burlington County	1987	Malone III, Joseph	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
	Bordentown City	Burlington County	1987	Scholey, Gloria	Mayor	Not Recalled
56	Belmar	Monmouth	1990	Colin, Roy	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled

	Belmar	Monmouth	1990	Hernandez, Maria	Mayor	Recalled
57	Cape May City	Cape May	1990	Infanto, Angelo	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Cape May City	Cape May	1990	Tracy, Joseph A.	Mayor	Recalled
58	West New York	Hudson	1993	DeFino, Anthony M.	Mayor	Recalled**
	West New York	Hudson	1993	Hernandez, Mario	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled**
	West New York	Hudson	1993	Riccardi, Lawrence	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled**
	West New York	Hudson	1993	Suarez, Luis	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled**
	West New York	Hudson	1993	Vega, Silverio	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled**
59	Belleville	Essex	1993	Spillane, Thomas J.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
60	Hawthorne	Passaic	1994	Colyer, Kenneth	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	Hawthorne	Passaic	1994	Recchione, Louis	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
61	Lodi	Bergen	1994	Toronto, Philip V.	Mayor	Not Recalled
62	River Vale	Bergen	1994	Geier, Patricia	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
	River Vale	Bergen	1994	Jones, Walter V.	Mayor	Recalled
	River Vale	Bergen	1994	Salmon, Bernard	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
63	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1996	Candiano, Patricia H.	Mayor	Recalled
	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1996	Harrington, William H.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
64	Franklin Lakes	Bergen	1996	Kahn, Malcolm	Board of Education	Not Recalled
65	Asbury Park	Monmouth	1999	Murray, Louise L.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled
66	Beach Haven	Ocean	2000	Anderson, Andrew H.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
67	Chesilhurst	Camden	2001	Gray-Sadler, Kati	Mayor	Recalled
68	Pilesgrove	Salem	2003	Parnszewski, Patricia	Board of Education	Recalled
69	Roosevelt	Monmouth	2005	Marko, Neil	Mayor	Recalled
70	Mount Olive	Morris	2006	De La Roche, Richard	Mayor	Recalled

71	Victory Gardens	Morris	2006	Courtine, Nanette	Mayor	Recalled
72	Franklin	Somerset	2007	Ritchie, Ellen	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
73	Denville	Morris	2008	McCloskey, James	Municipal Council Member	Recalled
74	Hardyston	Sussex	2008	Boffa, Margaret "Marbeth"	Board of Education	Recalled
75	Frankford	Sussex	2009	Sutphen, Paul	Mayor	Recalled
76	Wildwood	Cape May	2009	Davenport, Bill	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled
	Wildwood	Cape May	2009	Troiano, Jr. Ernie	Mayor	Recalled***
77	Point Pleasant Beach	Ocean	2010	Barrella, Vincent R.	Mayor	Not Recalled
78	Ridgefield Borough	Bergen	2010	Suarez, Anthony	Mayor	Not Recalled
79	West Wildwood	Cape May	2010	Frederick, Herbert	Mayor	Not Recalled
	West Wildwood	Cape May	2010	Golden, Scott W	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
	West Wildwood	Cape May	2010	McNamara, Gerard	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled
80	Mahwah	Bergen	2018	Laforet, William	Mayor	Recalled

<sup>\*\*</sup>Reelected in same election \*\*\*Reelected later

### RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - ATLANTIC

ATLANTIC	COUN	NTY			
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Atlantic City	1913	Riddle, William	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1913	Bartlett, William H.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1913	Beyer, Albert	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1936	White, Charles D.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1942	Taggart, Jr., Thomas D.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1945	Altman, Joseph	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1973	Bradway, Joseph F. Jr.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1981	Lazarow, Joseph	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1981	Colanzi, Ed	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1981	Clayton, Willie	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1984	Matthews, Michael	Mayor	Recalled	
Atlantic City	1997	Jones, Jr. Gibb	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	1997	Whelan, James	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	2002	Johnson, Ronald L.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Atlantic City	2007	Levy, Robert	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Atlantic City	2010	Langford, Lorenzo	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Buena	2021	D'Alessandro, Joseph	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Buena	2021	Zappariello, David	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Folsom	1990	Gandolfi, Edward	Mayor	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Folsom	1990	Effinger, Albert Jr.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Folsom	1990	Parker, Harold	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Galloway	2020	Maldonado, Robert	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Longport	1994	Fiore, William	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Longport	1994	Martin, Joseph A.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Ventnor	2013	Bangell, Michael	Mayor	No Recall Election	

BERGEN CO	OUNTY				
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Bogota	2013	Robbins, Robert	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Bogota	2013	McHale, Patrick	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Bogota	2013	Jackson, Antero	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Emerson	2002	Calogero, Gina	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Resigned
Emerson	2004	Setteducati Steve	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Emerson	2012	DiPaola, Danielle	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Englewood Cliffs	2020	Aversa, Edward	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Englewood Cliffs	2020	Oh, Gloria	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Fair Lawn	1958	Sogorka, Frank	Mayor	No Recall Election	Did not run again
Fair Lawn	1958	Matule, Joseph	Matule, Joseph  Municipal Council  Member  No Recall Election		Removed by law after criminal conviction
Fair Lawn	2009	Tedeschi, Joseph	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Fairview	1966	Deer, James	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Fort Lee	1995	Voss, Joan	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Fort Lee	1995	Criscione, John	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Franklin Lakes	1996	Kahn, Malcolm	Board of Education	Not Recalled	
Garfield	1974	Calandriello, Frank	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Garfield	1974	Jarosz, Irene	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Garfield	1974	Conte, Kenneth	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Garfield	1974	Visotcky, Richard	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Garfield	1974	Wisniewski, John	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1935	Altschuler, Robert A.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1935	Eck, William J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1935	Korn, Ernst	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1935	de Clairmont, Ralph F.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1938	Foschini, Paul J.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1938	Ferber, Frederick V.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	

Hackensack	1959	Bosshard, Harry P.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	Reelected 1977
Hackensack	1959	Deuell, Edgar P.	Mayor	Recalled	
Hackensack	1959	Feber, Herman S.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Hackensack	1959	Frapaul, Peter	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	Reelected 1961
Hackensack	1959	Voorhis, Nichols	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Hackensack	1963	Wysocki, Kazmier	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Hackensack	1963	Freeman, Charles R.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Hackensack	1972	Wysocki, Kazmier	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1979	Bosshard, Harry P.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1979	Paylick, Carmella	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1979	Trammel, James T.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1987	Cerbo, Fred	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1987	Smith, John	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1987	Francis, Conrad	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1987	Elder, Barbara	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1987	Della Torre, Thomas	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1988	Cerbo, Fred	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1988	Smith, John	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1988	Francis, Conrad	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1988	Elder, Barbara	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	1988	Della Torre, Thomas	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	2012	Gardner, Clarissa	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	2012	Martinez, Carol	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Hackensack	2012	Williams Bembry, Rhonda	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Lost Reelection Campaign
Leonia	2001	Kaufman, Paul	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1924	Dansen, Benjamin Jr.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1960	Cuccia, Joseph	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Lodi	1960	Focarino, Bernard	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Lodi	1960	Luna, Joseph	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	

т 1:	1060	)	Municipal Council	D 11 1	
Lodi	1960	Melango, Louis	Member	Recalled	
Lodi	1960	Scibetta, John F.	Mayor	Recalled	
Lodi	1968	Cuccio, James J.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1968	Bombace, John	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1968	Wagenti, Jack	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1968	DeSomma, Thomas	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1968	Warchol, George	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1975	Bombase, John	Mayor	Recalled	
Lodi	1975	Direnzo, Alfred M.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Lodi	1975	Warchol, George	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Lodi	1983	Paci, Christopher M.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1990	Luna, Tony	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1990	Paladino, Vincent	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1990	Quatrone, Frank	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Lodi	1994	Toronto, Philip V.	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Lodi	2004	Paparozzi, Gary	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Lodi	2004	McCaskey, Bernadette	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Lodi	2004	Schrieks, Marc N.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Lodi	2004	Piparo, Joseph C.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Lodi	2004	Viscana, Karen	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Lyndhurst	1974	Checki Jr., Angel D.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Lyndhurst	1974	Smith, William	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Mahwah	2015	Laforet, William	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Mahwah	2018	Laforet, William	Mayor	Recalled	
Moonachie	1957	Conti, William	Mayor	No Recall Election	Did not run again
Moonachie	1957	Rettino, Ernest A.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Did not run again
Oakland	1996	Garzone, Vivian	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Oradell	2000	Snedeker, James	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Park Ridge	2017	Maguire, Terry	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Ramsey	2004	Muti, Richard	Mayor	No Recall Election	

		I			
Ridgefield Borough	2010	Suarez, Anthony	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Ridgefield Park	1928	McGowan, Hugh Jr.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Ridgefield Park	1928	Ferris, Edwin S.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Ridgefield Park	1928	Kneerim, Arthur W.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Ridgefield Park	1961	Monaghan, Gerald E.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Ridgefield Park	1961	Wagner Jr., William A.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Ridgefield Park	1961	Musella, Lawrence A.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Ridgefield Park	1965	Wagner, Jr. William A.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
Ridgefield Park	1965	Windecker, Louis E.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
Ridgefield Park	2021	Fernandez, Jorge	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Ridgefield Park	2021	Gibbons, Christopher	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Ridgefield Park	2021	Vercelli, Thomas	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
River Vale	1994	Geier, Patricia	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
River Vale	1994	Jones, Walter V.	Mayor	Recalled	
River Vale	1994	Salmon, Bernard	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Saddle River	1998	Dugan, Ruth	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Resigned
Teaneck	1933	Morten, Louis G.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Teaneck	1933	Paquin, Samuel	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Teaneck	1933	Van Wagner, Carl D.	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Teaneck	1933	Warner, Frederick T.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	

### RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - BURLINGTON

BURLINGTON CO	DUNTY				
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Beverly	1916	Roberts, J.V.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Beverly	1916	Snead, William T.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Bordentown City	1987	Bowker, Joseph	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Bordentown City	1987	Malone III, Joseph	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Bordentown City	1987	Scholey, Gloria	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Eight Legislative District	2019	Addiego, Dawn	State Senator	No Recall Election	
Evesham	1976	Manno Shenfeld, Sandra	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Fieldsboro	2003	Tyler, Buddy	Mayor	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Agair
Lumberton	2020	Hatfield, Kendra	Township Committee member	No Recall Election	
Lumberton	2020	Tuno, Ryan	Township Committee member	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Agair
Mansfield	2004	DeLorenzo, Patrick	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Mansfield	2022	Tillett, Kerri	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Resigned
Medford Lakes	2009	Weiss, Paul	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Mount Holly	1979	Weber, Joseph D.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Mount Holly	1979	Donnelly, Grace B.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Mount Holly	1979	Gsell, W. Douglas	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Mount Holly	1995	Logan, James	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Mount Holly	1995	Eckart, Glynn	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Mount Holly	2011	Gibson, Thomas	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Pemberton	2004	McCullough, Robert	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Pemberton	2004	Kemp, Corrine	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Pemberton	2004	Prickett, Richard	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Pemberton	2004	Williams, Clarence	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Pemberton	2004	Radice, Caroline	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Springfield	2018	Frank, David	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Willingboro	1995	Reynolds, Margaret	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Willingboro	1995	Rodriguez, Robert	Board of Education	No Recall Election	

# RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - CAMDEN

CAMDEN COU	INTY				
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Camden	1958	Brunner, George E.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Camden	1968	Pierce, Alfred R.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Camden	1974	Errichetti, Angelo J.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Camden	2000	Milan, Milton	Mayor	No Recall Election	Removed due to criminal conviction
Camden	2005	Fuentes, Angel	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Camden	2006	Faison, Gwendolyn A.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Cherry Hill	1988	Bass Levin, Susan	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Chesilhurst	2001	Gray-Sadler, Kati	Mayor	Recalled	Resigned
Gloucester Township	1976	Engelbert, Herman	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Gloucester Township	1976	Shorter, John	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Gloucester Township	1976	Calabrese, Arthur	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Gloucester Township	1976	DiJosie, Stanley	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Haddon Township	2004	Hogan, Kathleen	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Winslow	2006	Parker, Patricia	Board of Education	No Recall Election	

### RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - CAPE MAY

CAPE MAY COUNTY					
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Avalon	1925	Smith, Gilbert	Mayor	Recalled	
Avalon	1925	Barron, William	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Avalon	1925	Canfield, F. P.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Avalon	1941	Becker, Edward B.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Avalon	1941	Joiner, William C.H.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Avalon	1941	Stratton, Fowler H.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Avalon	1978	Riggall, Lloyd	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Avalon	1986	Sloan, Rachel H.	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Cape May City	1990	Gilbert, Harry	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Resigned
Cape May City	1990	Infanto, Angelo	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Cape May City	1990	Tracy, Joseph A.	Mayor	Recalled	
Cape May City	2015	Mahaney, Ed	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Cape May Point	1967	Chomiak, Michael	Mayor	Recalled	
Dennis	2003	Ireland-Haig, Anna	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Dennis	2003	Ross, Conseula	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Dennis	2003	Zipparo, William	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Ocean City	1929	Champion, Joseph G.	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Ocean City	1968	Chance, R. Robinson	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	Resigned
Ocean City	1985	Meis, William	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Ocean City	2004	Knight, Henry "Bud"	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Sea Isle City	1978	Kehner, William	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
West Cape May	1967	Smith, Edward L.	Mayor	Not Recalled	
West Wildwood	2010	Frederick, Herbert	Mayor	Not Recalled	

### RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - CAPE MAY

West Wildwood	2010	Golden, Scott W	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
West Wildwood	2010	McNamara, Gerard	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Wildwood	1913	Hendee, William C.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Wildwood	1913	Ryan, Ruben W.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Wildwood	1913	Smith, Frank E.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Wildwood	1921	Hendee, William C.	Mayor	Recalled	
Wildwood	1921	Smith, Frank E.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Wildwood	1921	Bright, Oliver	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Wildwood	1929	Pierpont, Robert G.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Wildwood	1938	Bradway, Doris	Mayor	Recalled	
Wildwood	1938	McMurray, Frederick	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Wildwood	1949	Steele, W. Harry Jr.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Wildwood	1949	Maxwell, Bernard	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Wildwood	1949	Malley, Clarence M.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Wildwood	1984	Ostrander, Earl B.	Mayor	Recalled	
Wildwood	1997	Sloan, Duane	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Wildwood	2009	Davenport, Bill	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Wildwood	2009	Troiano, Jr. Ernie	Mayor	Recalled	Reelected 2011
Wildwood Crest	1975	Guhr, Charles	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Wildwood Crest	1975	Anzelone, Victor	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Wildwood Crest	1975	Schard, Arthur	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Woodbine	1980	Levin, Thomas	Mayor	No Recall Election	

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - CUMBERLAND

CUMBERLAND COUNTY								
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE			
Downe	1991	Ricci, Helga	Board of Education	No Recall Election				
Downe	1991	Ripper, George	Board of Education	No Recall Election				
Downe	1991	Chance, Donald	Board of Education	No Recall Election				
Downe	1991	Green, Oliver	Board of Education	No Recall Election				
Downe	1991	Hartem, Nancy	Board of Education	No Recall Election				
Millville	1950	Cherivtch, Simon	Mayor	No Recall Election				
Millville	1980	Aronoff, Ethan W.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled				
Millville	2011	Vanamen, Dave	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election				
Vineland	2014	Bermudez, Ruben	Mayor	No Recall Election				

### RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - ESSEX

ESSEX COU	JNTY				
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Belleville	1964	Addonizio, G. George	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Belleville	1964	Laterza, Robert	Mayor	Recalled	
Belleville	1964	Strumolo, Vincent	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Belleville	1993	Spillane, Thomas J.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Belleville	2002	Risoli, Angelo C.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Belleville	2003	Melham, Michael	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Belleville	2003	Fuscaldo, Thomas	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Lost Reelection Campaign
Belleville	2015	Burke, Marie Strumolo	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Bloomfield	2016	Chalet, Elias	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Removed
Cedar Grove	2022	Dye, Chrissy	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Resigned
East Orange	1976	Hart, William S.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Lost
Essex County	1980	Shapiro, Peter	County Executive	No Recall Election	
Fairfield	1974	DeBella, Samuel	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Fairfield	1974	Puglisi, Joseph	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Irvington	2015	Vauss, Anthony	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Millburn	2022	Miggins, Margaret	Mayor	Pending	
Millburn	2022	Vinayak, Sanjeev	Township Committee Member	Pending	
Newark	1940	Ellenstein, Meyer	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Newark	1940	Franklin, Pearce	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Newark	1967	Addonizio, Hugh J.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Newark	1969	Bernstein, Lee	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Newark	1971	Gibson, Kenneth A.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Newark	1973	Giuliano, Anthony J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	

### RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - ESSEX

Newark	1973	Bontempo, Michael A.	Municipal Council	No Recall	
TWWIIK	1773	Bontempo, Whender 71.	Member	Election	
Newark	1973	Villani, Ralph A.	Municipal Council	No Recall	
Newark	19/3	v mani, Kaipii A.	Member	Election	
NI1-	1075	Cilman Wannada A	M	No Recall	
Newark	1975	Gibson, Kenneth A.	Mayor	Election	
Newark	1979	Cileren Vennetle A	Marran	No Recall	
Newark	19/9	Gibson, Kenneth A.	Mayor	Election	
NT 1	1006	C . A .1	Municipal Council	No Recall	
Newark	1996	Carrino, Anthony	Member	Election	
NT 1	2002	T 01	2.6	No Recall	
Newark	2003	James, Sharpe	Mayor	Election	
NT 1	2005	D 1 G	27	No Recall	
Newark	2007	Booker, Cory	Mayor	Election	
North	• • • •			No Recall	
Caldwell	2004	Arena, Toni	Board of Education	Election	
North		a # 4		No Recall	
Caldwell	2004	Gallo, Linda	Board of Education	Election	
		I II al I		No Recall	
Nutley	2021	Kucinski, Charles	Board of Education	Election	
_				No Recall	
Orange	2007	Hackett, Mims	Mayor	Election	Resigned
_				No Recall	
Orange	2018	Warren, Dwayne D.	Mayor	Election	
				No Recall	
Roseland	2015	Gordon, Anna	Board of Education	Election	
			Municipal Council	No Recall	Did Not
Roseland	2017	Tsilionis, Thomas	Member	Election	Run Again
South				No Recall	I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I
Orange	1984	Spiotta, Bertrand	Village President (Mayor)	Election	
				No Recall	Did Not
West Orange	1996	Spina, Samuel	Mayor	Election	Run Again
				Licetion	Kun Again

### RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - GLOUCESTER

GLOUCESTER COUNTY								
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE			
Clayton	2001	Keller, Grant	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned			
Deptford	1984	Kivlen, Joseph J.	Mayor	Not Recalled				
Franklin	2006	Gallagher, Kenneth	Township Committee member	No Recall Election				
Gloucester County	2015	Sweeney, Steve	State Senate President	No Recall Election				
Monroe	1984	Richman, Howard T.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned			
Newfield	1981	Marshall III, Everette	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election				
Newfield	1981	Martin, Grace	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election				
Newfield	1981	Alvino, David	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election				
Newfield	2013	Carrow, Michael	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election				
Newfield	2013	Marshall III, Everette	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election				
Washington	2004	Abbott, Eileen	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Reelected			
Washington	2004	Saghirian, Carol	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Reelected			
Washington	2006	Moriarty, Paul	Mayor	No Recall Election				

HUDSON C	OUNTY				
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Bayonne	1918	Cronin, Matthew T.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Bayonne	1918	Roberson, Horace	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Bayonne	1918	Mara, Hugh	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Bayonne	1918	Wilson, Henry	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Bayonne	1924	Talbot, Robert J.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Bayonne	1924	O'Connell, P.J.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Bayonne	1924	Hosford, Harry	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Bayonne	2016	Davis, Jimmy	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Bayonne	2016	Gullace, Sal	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hoboken	1986	Vezzetti, Thomas	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Hoboken	2022	Cohen, Phil	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Hudson County	2015	Balmir, Gerard	County Freeholder	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Jersey City	1927	Saul, John	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	Resigned
Jersey City	1950	Kenny, John V.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	1950	Spence, Donald	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	1971	Flaherty, Thomas J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Removed
Jersey City	1971	Jaroski, John J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	1971	Kelaher, John J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	1971	Massa, William	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	1971	McGovern, Thomas J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	1971	Pecoraro, Aniello	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	1971	Quilty, Frank	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	

Jersey City	1971	Whelan, Thomas J.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Removed
Jersey City	1986	Cucci, Anthony R.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	2010	Brennan, Peter	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	2010	Healy, Jeremiah	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	2010	Vega, Mariano	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Resigned
Jersey City	2010	Flood, Willie	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Resigned
Jersey City	2010	Lopez, Nidia	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Jersey City	2022	DeGise, Amy	Municipal Council Member	Pending	
North Bergen	1949	Cullum, Paul F.	Mayor	Recalled	
North Bergen	1949	Fugman, Jr., Anthony	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
North Bergen	1949	Roe, John J.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
North Bergen	1969	Sarubbi, Angelo J.	Mayor	Not Recalled	
North Bergen	1969	Weaver, Charles J.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
North Bergen	1969	Jialdini, Joseph J.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
North Bergen	1969	Steinel, Jr. Charles J.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
North Bergen	1969	Burger, George E. Jr.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
North Bergen	1978	Affuso, Ralph	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
North Bergen	1978	Brady, William V.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
North Bergen	1978	Duffy, John J.	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
North Bergen	1978	Mocco, Peter	Mayor	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
North Bergen	1978	Pinto, Alfonso	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election

North Bergen	1980	DiVincent, Anthony	Mayor	Not Recalled	Reelected Same Election
North Bergen	1980	Fortunato, Nicholas "Smokey"	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
North Bergen	1980	Bier, Bernard	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
North Bergen	1980	Dolan, George	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
North Bergen	1980	Duffy, John	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
North Bergen	1985	Hass, Charles	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
North Bergen	1985	Nadler, Marvin	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
North Bergen	1985	DiVincent, Anthony	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
North Bergen	1985	Ferrigno, Carl	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	Resigned
North Bergen	1985	Fortunato, Nicholas "Smokey"	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	Resigned
Union City	1972	Calandrillo, Harry	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Union City	1972	Clark, Frank	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Union City	1972	Logarmarsino, James	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Union City	1972	Lombardo, Paul	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Union City	1972	Meehan, Frank	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Union City	2000	Garcia, Raul "Rudy"	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
West New York	1993	DeFino, Anthony M.	Mayor	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
West New York	1993	Hernandez, Mario	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
West New York	1993	Riccardi, Lawrence	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
West New York	1993	Suarez, Luis	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
West New York	1993	Vega, Silverio	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	Reelected Same Election
West New York	2009	Fernandez-Lopez, Michelle	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	

West New York	2009	Lange, Jr. Gerald	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
West New York	2009	Riccardi, Lawrence	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
West New York	2009	Rodriguez, Alberto	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
West New York	2009	Vega, Silverio "Sal"	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
West New York	2013	Frias, Fior D'Aliza	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
West New York	2013	Rodriguez, Caridad	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
West New York	2013	Roque, Felix	Mayor	No Recall Election	Reelected 2015
West New York	2013	Vargas, Ruben	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	

HUNTERDON COUNTY					
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Califon	1997	Winter, Gloria	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Califon	1997	Nencheck, Victoria	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Califon	1997	Harrison, William	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Clinton Township	1993	Kennedy, Franklin	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Clinton Township	1993	Lauer, Cheryl	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Clinton Township	1993	Lentine, Barbara	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Clinton Township	1993	Miller, Gwen	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Clinton Township	1993	Orlando, Martha	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Clinton Township	1993	Zektick, Robert	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Delaware	1998	Mathews, Jim	Township Committee member	No Recall Election	
Flemington	2021	Driver, Betsy	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Hunterdon County	2009	Trout, Deborah	County Sheriff	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Raritan Township	1951	Forgione, James	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Raritan Township	1951	Walker, Russell	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	

MERCER COUNTY						
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME		
Ewing	2006	Murphy, Joseph	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Ewing	2006	Steinmann, Bert	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Ewing	2006	Summiel, Les	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Hamilton	1992	Angarone, Michael	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Hamilton	1992	Burkhalter, Peter	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Hamilton	1992	DeMarco, Carmela	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Hamilton	1992	Lacy, Jack	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Hamilton	1992	Rafferty, Jack	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Hightstown	2008	Patten, Robert	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Trenton	1912	Donnelly, Frederick W.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Trenton	1912	Burk, William F.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election		
Trenton	1912	Fell, J.R.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election		
Trenton	2007	Palmer, Doug	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Trenton	2011	Mack, Tony	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Trenton	2020	Gusciora, Reed	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Trenton	2020	Harrison, Joe	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Trenton	2020	Vaughn, Robin	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		

### RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - MIDDLESEX

MIDDLESEX COUNTY						
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE	
Carteret	2020	Johal, A.J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Carteret	2021	Reiman, Daniel J.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
East Brunswick	1983	Fox, William F.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
East Brunswick	1983	Weber, Geraldine	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
East Brunswick	1983	O'Connor, Jerome	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Edison	2004	Kruczak, William A.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Resigned	
Edison	2006	Choi, Jun	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Jamesburg	1978	Forst, Frank	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Metuchen	1973	Cummings, Jr. William C.	Board of Education	No Recall Election		
Metuchen	1973	Slobodien, Sally	Board of Education	No Recall Election		
Metuchen	1973	Cammarano, Frank J.	Board of Education	No Recall Election		
New Brunswick	1969	Sheehan, Patricia Q.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
New Brunswick	1969	Valenti, Carl T.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
New Brunswick	1969	Smith, John A.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
New Brunswick	1969	Cooper, Aldrage B.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
New Brunswick	1969	Cahill, William J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
New Brunswick	1972	Sheehan, Patricia Q.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
New Brunswick	1972	Cooper, Aldrage B.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Old Bridge	1988	Haney, Arthur M.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Perth Amboy	1973	Jankowski, Alexander F.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Perth Amboy	1990	Otlowski, George J.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned	
Perth Amboy	2019	Diaz, Wilda	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Piscataway	1969	Knight, Frank J.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Spotswood	1974	Brundage, Donald	Mayor	Not Recalled		
Spotswood	1974	Dubester, Nathan	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled		

### RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - MONMOUTH

MONMOUTH COUNTY						
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE	
Asbury Park	1935	Croce, Louis P.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled		
Asbury Park	1935	Digney, James J.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled		
Asbury Park	1935	Henry, Sidney L.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled		
Asbury Park	1935	Dennis, Sherman O.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Asbury Park	1935	Silverstein, Dr. Max	Municipal Council Member	Recalled		
Asbury Park	1952	Smock, George A.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Asbury Park	1952	Ely, Joseph R.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Asbury Park	1952	Hines, Roland J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Asbury Park	1952	Keuper, Vincent P.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Asbury Park	1980	Albarelli, Ascenzio	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled		
Asbury Park	1980	English, Edward R.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled		
Asbury Park	1980	Harris, Lorenzo W.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled		
Asbury Park	1980	Kramer, Ray	Mayor	Not Recalled		
Asbury Park	1980	Zachary, Henrietta L.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled		
Asbury Park	1984	Kramer, Ray	Mayor	Not Recalled		
Asbury Park	1996	Candiano, Patricia H.	Mayor	Recalled		
Asbury Park	1996	Harrington, William H.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled		
Asbury Park	2000	Murray, Louise L.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled		
Asbury Park	2003	Mellina, Kate	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Asbury Park	2010	Breech, Connie	Board of Education	No Recall Election		
Asbury Park	2010	DiSanto, Robert	Board of Education	No Recall Election		
Asbury Park	2010	Hopson, Gregory	Board of Education	No Recall Election		
Asbury Park	2012	Bruno, James	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Asbury Park	2012	Henderson, Susan	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - MONMOUTH

Asbury Park	2012	Johnson, Ed	Mayor	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Asbury Park	2012	Loffredo, John	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	1.29****
Asbury Park	2012	Sanders, Kevin	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Asbury Park	2016	Kendle, Jesse	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Atlantic Highlands	1969	White, James T.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Atlantic Highlands	1969	Bahrs, John A.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Resigned
Atlantic Highlands	1969	Black, Herman J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Atlantic Highlands	1969	Vaugn, Ernest F.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Avon- By-The- Sea	1968	Clements, Joseph H.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Avon- By-The- Sea	1968	Leach, William J.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	Resigned
Belmar	1990	Colin, Roy	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Belmar	1990	Hernandez, Maria	Mayor	Recalled	
Bradley Beach	1916	Macdonald, William E.	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Bradley Beach	1916	Poland, Bernard V.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Bradley Beach	1916	Rogers, A.T.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Deal	1914	Frick, George	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	Resigned
Deal	1914	Bach, AJ	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	Resigned
Deal	1914	Levy, William	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Deal	1946	Beringer, Theodore H.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Deal	1946	Jaeger, Frank E.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Deal	1946	Opdyke, Chester B.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Hazlet	2006	Coughlin, Paul A.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Howell	2006	DiBella, Joseph	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Howell	2016	Nicastro, Robert	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1927	Maher, James P.	Mayor	Recalled	
Keansburg	1928	Randolph, Samuel	Mayor	No Recall Election	

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - MONMOUTH

	ı	1			I
Keansburg	1928	Nightingale, Fred	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1928	Watson, Clarence H.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1934	Franck, A.A.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Keansburg	1934	Martin, Jacob F.S.	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Keansburg	1934	Turner, William	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Keansburg	1950	Brennan, Felix J.	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Keansburg	1968	Bellezza, Leonard S.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1968	McGrath, Alphonsus M.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1968	Graham, Harry	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1979	Hayes, Ronald	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1979	Kinlin, Thomas	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1979	Roeseman, Walter	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1983	Currie, Robert T.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Keansburg	1983	Kauffmann, George E.	Mayor	Recalled	Reelected 1986
Keansburg	1983	Lloyd, Eileen	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Keansburg	1995	Razzano, Mary Lou	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1995	Ferraro, Judy	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Keansburg	1995	Flores, Manuel	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Long Branch	1913	Arrowsmith, Thomas T.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Long Branch	1913	Woodley, Marshall	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Long Branch	1913	Newcomb, Bryant B.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Long Branch	1922	Zartman, Samuel E.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Long Branch	1949	Jones, J. William	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Long Branch	1949	Bruno, Basil B.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Long Branch	1949	McCarthy, Joseph P.	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Long Branch	1949	Sherman, Walton	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - MONMOUTH

			Municipal	No Recall	
Long Branch	1949	Tomaini, Joseph J.	Commissioner	Election	
I D 1	1062	Van Brunt, Carlton	Municipal Council	No Recall	
Long Branch	1962	M.	Member	Election	
Long Branch	1964	Cioffi, Henry R.	Municipal Council	No Recall	
Long Brunen	1701	Cicin, Hein'y It.	Member	Election	
Long Branch	1964	Mazza, Vincent J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
-		McClintock, Thomas	Municipal Council	No Recall	
Long Branch	1964	L.	Member	Election	Resigned
T D 1	1064		Municipal Council	No Recall	
Long Branch	1964	Penn, Robert L.	Member	Election	
Long Branch	1964	Wilson, Lucy	Municipal Council	No Recall	
Long Branch	1704	Wilson, Lucy	Member	Election	
Long Branch	1968	Nastasio, Jr. Paul	Mayor	No Recall	
Zeng Zimien	1,00	1 (46) (41) 1 (44)	The state of the s	Election	
Long Branch	1996	Celli, Mary Jane	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
-		-	Municipal Council	No Recall	
Long Branch	1996	Giordano, Anthony	Member	Election	
I D 1	1006	Zambrano, John	Municipal Council	No Recall	
Long Branch	1996	"Fazz"	Member	Election	
Marlboro	1968	Creevy, George E.	Municipal Council	Recalled	
Mariooro	1900	Cicevy, George E.	Member	Recalled	
Marlboro	1968	Storer, Alfred L.	Municipal Council	Recalled	
		,	Member	N. D. 11	
Middletown	2008	Walsh, Patricia	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
D 1.	2005	26 1 27 1	3.6		
Roosevelt	2005	Marko, Neil	Mayor	Recalled	
Spring Lake	1997	Casagrande, Theresa	Board of Education	No Recall	Did Not Run
Heights	1771	Casagranae, Theresa	Dourd of Education	Election	Again
Spring Lake	2007	Malick, Elwood	Mayor	No Recall	
Heights		· .	Township Committee	Election No Recall	
Wall	1947	Holloway, Albert	member	Election	
			Township Committee	No Recall	
Wall	1947	Bennett, Leroy	member	Election	

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - MORRIS

MORRIS COUNTY						
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE	
Chester Township	2011	Johnston, Jim	Board of Education	No Recall Election		
Denville	1997	Spencer, Carol A.	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Denville	2008	McCloskey, James	Municipal Council Member	Recalled		
Dover	2018	Dodd, James	Mayor	No Recall Election	Lost Reelection	
East Hanover	2006	Agnellino, William	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Jefferson	1974	Atkinson, Ralph M.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned	
Jefferson	1974	Florio, Joseph	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Jefferson	1974	Chamberlain, Horace Jr.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Jefferson	1974	Gunnesson, Alvin O.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Jefferson	1974	Dunney, Richard	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Jefferson	1974	Opeken, James	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Long Hill	1997	Nergaard, Maryann	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Mendham Borough	2011	Schram, Jacqueline	Board of Education	No Recall Election		
Mine Hill	1985	Young, Steven	Mayor	No Recall Election		
Mine Hill	1991	Colucci, Gary	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Mine Hill	1991	Tasnady, John K.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Mine Hill	1991	McCauley, Mark	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Mine Hill	1991	Crnarich, Louis	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Mine Hill	1991	Lieberman, Gary	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election		
Montville	1996	Vasak, Joann	Board of Education	No Recall Election		
Montville	1996	Holzmann, Glenn	Board of Education	No Recall Election		
Montville	2006	Cohen, Steve	Board of Education	No Recall Election		

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - MORRIS

Montville	2006	Cooney, Frank	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Montville	2006	Feaster, Karl	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Montville	2006	Lindert, Tim	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Montville	2006	Palma, Michael	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Morristown	1975	Manahan, David V.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Morristown	1980	Cresitello, Donald	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Morristown	1982	Cline, William	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Mount Olive	2006	De La Roche, Richard	Mayor	Recalled	
Mountain Lakes	2020	Chang, Joseph	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Netcong	2015	Dalesandro, Bernadette	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Parsippany-Troy Hills	1956	Manning, Edward V.	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Parsippany-Troy Hills	1956	West, George	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Parsippany-Troy Hills	1956	Walter, S. Earl	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Parsippany-Troy Hills	1956	Frayler, Louis	Municipal Council Member	Not Recalled	
Pequannock	1981	Glinbizzi, Nathaniel "Nate"	Mayor	Recalled	
Pequannock	2008	Alleva, Alberta	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Pequannock	2008	Hardaker, Kenneth	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Rockaway Township	1986	Wojtaszek, John	Mayor	Recalled	
Rockaway Township	2018	Jedynak, Jeremy	Mayor	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Rockaway Township	2019	Palumbo, Victor	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Resigned
Victory Gardens	2006	Courtine, Nanette	Mayor	Recalled	
		1			1

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - OCEAN

OCEAN COUN	NTY				
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Beach Haven	1972	Pharo, Watson	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Beach Haven	2000	Anderson, Andrew H.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Beachwood	2009	Jones, Jr. Ronald W.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Berkeley	1984	Palkoski, Zenon	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Berkeley	1984	Corrigan, Edmund J.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Berkeley	2001	Varano, Jason J.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Brick	1954	Hunter, John	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Brick	1954	Bonhag, Carol	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Brick	1969	McGuckin, John F.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Brick	1976	Kinnevy, John P.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Harvey Cedars	1966	Thomas, Reynold	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Harvey Cedars	1966	Hill, J. Michael	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	Resigned
Harvey Cedars	1966	Bohne, Edmund	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	Resigned
Island Heights	1979	Saladino, Joseph A.	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Island Heights	1979	Murray, Paul R.	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Island Heights	1981	Kushner, Howard	Mayor	Recalled	
Island Heights	1985	Bloom, Joseph	Mayor	Recalled	
Jackson	2008	Seda, Mark A.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Lacey	2014	Schubiger, Eric	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Lacey	2014	Tirella, Maureen	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Lacey	2018	Downing, Linda	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Lakewood	2006	Coles, Raymond G.	Township Committee Member	No Recall Election	
Lakewood	2006	Lichtenstein, Meir	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Lakewood	2006	Singer, Robert W.	Township Committee Member	No Recall Election	
Lakewood	2007	Cuncliffe, Charles	Township Committee Member	No Recall Election	
Little Egg Harbor	1976	Koptic, Joseph	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Little Egg Harbor	1995	Mathis, John L. "Lew"	Fire Commissioner	No Recall Election	

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - OCEAN

Long Beach	1957	Graham, Wils T.	Mayor	Recalled	
Long Beach	1957	Parker, Ralph	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recalled	
Plumsted	2023	Cuozzo, Dominick	Township Committee Member	Pending	
Point Pleasant Beach	1996	Ciliberto, Steven J. Sr.	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Removed
Point Pleasant Beach	2010	Barrella, Vincent R.	Mayor	Not Recalled	
Stafford	1983	Bell, Wesley K.	Mayor	Recalled	

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - PASSAIC

PASSAIC CO	UNTY				
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Bloomingdale	2003	Cutler, Mark	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Resigned
Bloomingdale	2003	Keeler, Keith	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Resigned
Bloomingdale	2003	Ball, Edward	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Hawthorne	1929	Mason, Peter	Municipal Commissioner	Recalled	
Hawthorne	1929	Evans, Alfred C.	Municipal Commissioner	Not Recall Election	Resigned
Hawthorne	1938	Maitland, Robert	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Hawthorne	1994	Colyer, Kenneth	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Hawthorne	1994	Recchione, Louis	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Little Falls	2000	Ricciardelli, Rick	Township Committee member	No Recall Election	
Passaic City	1974	Goldman, Gerald	Mayor	No Recall Election	Did not run again
Passaic City	1983	Hare, Robert	Mayor	Recalled	
Passaic City	1992	Lipari, Joseph	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Passaic County	2008	Rosado, Sonia	County Freeholder	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Passaic County	2008	Way, Tahesha	County Freeholder	No Recall Election	Lost Reelection
Paterson	1971	Kramer, Pat	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Prospect Park	2008	Khairullah, Mohamed	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Wayne	1980	Hanse, William	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Wayne	1980	O'Brien, John	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Wayne	1980	Pacca, Robert	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Wayne	1988	Messercola, Louis	Mayor	No Recall Election	Resigned
Wayne	2013	Mazzei, Franco	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Wayne	2017	Jasterzbski, Richard	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
West Milford	1979	Sambraus, Richard J.	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - PASSAIC

West Milford	2001	Harkey, Maria	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election
West Milford	2001	Moshman, Robert	Mayor	No Recall Election
West Milford	2001	Weisbecker, Philip	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election
West Paterson	2008	Lepore, Pat	Mayor	No Recall Election

# RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - SALEM

SALEM COUNTY						
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE	
Pilesgrove	2003	Paruszewski, Patricia	Board of Education	Recalled		

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY – SOMERSET

SOMERSET O	COUNTY	<i>Y</i>			
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Bedminster	2006	Joerger, Kurt	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Resigned
Franklin	1972	Naruta, Alexander	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Franklin	1972	Knolmayer, Joseph	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Franklin	1972	DeVries, David	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	
Franklin	2007	Ritchie, Ellen	Municipal Council Member	Recalled	
Franklin	2018	Prasad, Rajiv	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Did not run again
North Plainfield	1983	Novak, Steven Jr.	Mayor	No Recall Election	Won reelection
Raritan Borough	2017	Fallon, Anna	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Warren	2005	Hundt, Michelle	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Warren	2005	Zimmerman, Ellen	Board of Education	No Recall Election	

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - SUSSEX

SUSSEX CO	UNTY				
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE
Byram	2020	McElroy, Andrew R.	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Resigned
Frankford	2008	McDowell, Robert	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Frankford	2009	Sutphen, Paul	Mayor	Recalled	
Hardyston	2008	Boffa, Margaret "Marbeth"	Board of Education	Recalled	
Hopatcong	2014	Lundin, Clifford	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Hopatcong	2014	Krowl, Delores	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Hopatcong	2014	Antonelli, Judith	Board of Education	No Recall Election	Lost Reelection
Montague	1981	Masset, Emmy	Mayor	No Recall Election	
Montague	1981	Rose, Sidney	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	
Montague	2013	Borrego, Beverly	Board of Education	No Recall Election	
Sparta	2008	Brady, Brian	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Sparta	2008	Goldberg, Manny	Mayor	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Sparta	2008	Spekhardt, Michael	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Stillwater	2008	Fuoco, Alfred	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again
Vernon	2019	Murphy, Jean	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	

#### RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - UNION

UNION COUNTY									
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE				
Clark	1995	Ellenport, Robert	Mayor	No Recall Election					
Cranford	1973	McVey, Jack C.	Mayor	No Recall Election					
Elizabeth	1989	Dunn, Thomas	Mayor	No Recall Election					
Garwood	2012	Mathieu, Jim	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election					
Plainfield	1996	Fury, Mark	Mayor	No Recall Election					
Rahway	1919	Furber, James B.*	Municipal Commissioner	No Recall Election	Removed				
Rahway	1976	Martin, Daniel	Mayor	No Recall Election					
Roselle	2005	Buska, Richard	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again				
Springfield	1995	Slote, Herb	Township Committee member	No Recall Election	Did Not Run Again				

<sup>\*</sup>Declined to appear on recall election ballot and was forced to vacate his commission seat. Reelected in 1922 and resigned again in 1924 facing threat of second recall election.

## RECALL ATTEMPTS BY COUNTY - WARREN

WARREN COUNTY								
LOCATION	YEAR	RECALL TARGET	TITLE	OUTCOME	NOTE			
Lopatcong	2016	McKay, Tom	Mayor	No Recall Election				
Phillipsburg	2017	Ellis, Stephen	Mayor	No Recall Election	Lost Reelection Campaign			
Pohatcong	1998	Montilone, Ralph	Board of Education	No Recall Election				
Washington	1999	Higgins, David	Mayor	No Recall Election				
Washington	1999	Parichuk, Dale	Municipal Council Member	No Recall Election				

#### PREVIOUS WHITE PAPERS

Number One: <u>Contribution Limits and Prohibited Contributions</u> (1988)

Number Two: <u>Trends in Legislative Campaign Financing</u>: <u>1977-1987</u> (1989)

Number Three: <u>Legislative Public Financing</u> (1989)

Number Four: <u>Ideas for an Alternate Funding Source</u> (1989)

Number Five: <u>Lobbying Reform</u> (1990)

Number Six: <u>Autonomy and Jurisdiction</u> (1991)

**Number Seven:** Is There a PAC Plague in New Jersey? (1991)

Number Eight:Technology in The Future:Strengthening Disclosure (1992)Number Nine:Legislative Candidates:How They Spend their Money (1994)Number Ten:Nonconnected, Ideological PACs in the Garden State (1995)

**Number Eleven:** State Parties and Legislative Leadership Committees: An Analysis

1994-1995 (1996)

Number Twelve: Repartyization: The Rebirth of Cty Organizations (1997)

Number Thirteen: <u>Trends in Legislative Campaign Financing</u>: 1987-1997 2<sup>nd</sup>Volume (1999)

Number Fourteen: <u>Local Campaign Financing</u> (2000)

Number Fifteen: School Board Campaign Financing (2002)

Number Sixteen: <u>A Resurgent Party System: Repartyization Takes Hold</u> (2003)

**Number Seventeen:** Legislative Election 2003: The Rise of Party-Oriented Campaigning (2004)

Number Eighteen: Local Campaign Financing: An Analysis of Trends in Communities Large and Small

(2005)

Number Nineteen: The 2005 Assembly Election: New Trends on the Horizon? (2006)

Number Twenty: Legislative General Elections 2007: An Analysis of Trends in State Senate and

Assembly Elections (2009)

Number Twenty-One: School Elections Campaign Financing: An Update (2010)

**Number Twenty-Two:** Trends in Legislative Campaign Financing: Fundraising in the Era of Pay-to-Play

Reform, Self-Funders and Recession • 1999-2009 3<sup>rd</sup> Volume (2011)

Number Twenty-Three: Legislative General Elections 2011- Rise of the Independents (2013)

Number Twenty-Four: <u>Independents' Day: Seeking Disclosure in a New Era of Unlimited Special Interest</u>

Spending (2014)

Number Twenty-Five: Top Local Elections in NJ- A Tale of Two Cities and More (2015)

Number Twenty-Six: Legislative Elections 2013: Big Spending, Little Change Plus a History of Self-

Financing by Legislators and Others (2015)

Number Twenty-Seven: <u>Legislative Election 2015</u>: <u>Big Independent Spending, Big Assembly Shakeup</u> (2018)

Number Twenty-Eight: <u>Legislative Election 2017- The Mother of All NJ Legislative Races</u> (2020)

Number Twenty-Nine: "Legislative Election 2019- Shakeup in the 1st (2021)